

Entropy Semiring Forward-backward Algorithm for HMM Entropy Computation

Velimir M. Ilić

Abstract—The paper presents Entropy Semiring Forward-backward algorithm (*ESRFB*) and its application for memory efficient computation of the subsequence constrained entropy and state sequence entropy of a Hidden Markov Model (*HMM*) when an observation sequence is given. *ESRFB* is based on forward-backward recursion over the entropy semiring, having the lower memory requirement than the algorithm developed by Mann and MacCallum, with the same time complexity. Furthermore, when it is used with forward pass only, it is applicable for the computation of *HMM* entropy for a given observation sequence, with the same time and memory complexity as the previously developed algorithm by Hernando et al.

I. INTRODUCTION

Hidden Markov Models (*HMMs*) are standard probabilistic models for state sequences in sequential data labeling [10]. Subsequence constrained entropy of *HMM* explaining an observation sequence and state sequence entropy, are useful quantities which provide a measure of *HMM* uncertainty. One criterion for the estimation of the *HMM* quality is the entropy of state sequence explaining an observation sequence, which provides a measure of its uncertainty [9], [6].

The algorithms for *HMMs* mostly consider efficient marginalization which is usually performed using the forward-backward algorithm ([8]), which runs in $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$ time, where N denotes the number of states and T is the length of sequence. Recently, Mann and MacCallum have developed an algorithm for computation of *HMM* subsequence constrained entropy for similar probabilistic model conditional random fields (*CRF*), which is based on the marginal probabilities computation [9] with the same asymptotical complexity as *FB*. This algorithm can be adapted to work with *HMMs*, but when the sequence length is large it becomes memory demanding, since it needs $\mathcal{O}(NT)$ memory. On the other hand, Hernando et al. [6] developed the memory efficient algorithm for state sequence entropy computation which requires $\mathcal{O}(N)$ memory. The algorithm has the same time complexity as *FB*, but it is not applicable for the computation of subsequence constrained entropy.

In this paper we develop a new algorithm which can be used for both types of computations. The algorithm is based on forward-backward recursion over the entropy semiring [7] and is called Entropy Semiring Forward-backward algorithm (*ESRFB*). *ESRFB* has lower memory requirement than Mann-MacCallum's algorithm subsequence constrained entropy computation. Furthermore, when it is used with the forward pass only it can compute the entropy in the same time and space

as Hernando et al.'s algorithm. Moreover, it is shown how the Hernando et al.'s algorithm can be derived from *ESRFB*.

The paper is organized as follows. In section II we define the *HMM* and present the forward-backward algorithm (*FB*) for efficient marginalization of *HMM*. Section III reviews the algorithms by Hernando et. al. and Mann and McCallum, for efficient computation of *HMM* entropy and subsequence constrained entropy for a given observation sequence. Section IV gives the general *FB* algorithm which operates over the commutative semiring. Finally, section V considers the *FB* over the entropy semiring and its application to *HMM* entropy computation.

II. HIDDEN MARKOV MODELS AND FORWARD-BACKWARD ALGORITHM

In this paper, we adopt the following notation:

- The sequence $l, l+1, \dots, r$ is shortly denoted with $l:r$, and the sequence $0:l, r:T$ is denoted with $-l:r$
- Big letters are used for random variables (S_t, O_t) and the small ones for their realizations (s_t, o_t).
- The sequence of symbols is (S_l, \dots, S_r) is denoted with $S_{l:r}$, the sequence $(S_0, \dots, S_l, S_r, \dots, S_T)$ with $S_{-l:r}$ and similarly for $s_{l:r}$, $O_{l:r}$ and $o_{l:r}$ for $0 \leq l \leq r \leq T$.
- The sequences $S_{0:T}$, $O_{0:T}$, $s_{0:T}$ and $o_{0:T}$ are denoted with \mathbf{S} , \mathbf{O} , \mathbf{s} and \mathbf{o} , respectively.
- The variables are omitted in probability notation. Thus, $p(s_t, o_{1:t})$ stands for $P(S_t = s_t, O_{1:t} = o_{1:t})$, $p(\mathbf{o})$ for $P(\mathbf{O} = \mathbf{o})$ and so on.

Hidden Markov model (*HMM*) consists of the following elements:

- A Markov chain (S_0, \dots, S_T) , represented by an $N \times N$ stochastic matrix A , which describes the transition probabilities $a_{ij} = P(S_t = j | S_{t-1} = i)$ between the N states of the model, together with a probability distribution b_i , where $\pi_i = P(S_0 = i)$.
- A set of probability distributions, one for each hidden state, $b_i(o_t) = P(O_t = o_t | S_t = i)$, which model the emission of such observations. If there are M possible distinct observations, we accommodate the probability distributions to be in the rows of an $N \times M$ matrix B .

With these settings, the joint probability that state sequence \mathbf{S} takes value \mathbf{s} and the observation sequence \mathbf{O} takes value \mathbf{o} is given with:

$$p(\mathbf{s}, \mathbf{o}) = \pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0) \prod_{t=1}^T a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t). \quad (1)$$

Using the probability conditions $\sum_{s_t} a_{s_{t-1}s_t} = 1$ and $\sum_{o_t} b_{s_t}(o_t) = 1$, we can derive two important equations which

characterizes *HMM* and will be used in the rest of the paper:

$$p(s_{0:i}, o_{0:i}) = \pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0) \prod_{t=1}^i a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t), \quad (2)$$

$$p(s_{i+1:T}, o_{i+1:T} | s_t) = \prod_{t=i+1}^T a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t). \quad (3)$$

One of the main problems in *HMMs* is efficient marginalization of computation of the *HMM* conditional probability $p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o})$:

$$p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) = \sum_{\mathbf{s}_{-l:r}} p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) = \sum_{\mathbf{s}_{-l:r}} \frac{p(\mathbf{s}, \mathbf{o})}{p(\mathbf{o})}. \quad (4)$$

The computation of (4) by enumerating all the $\mathbf{s} \in \mathcal{S}^{T+1}$ requires about TN^{T+1} additions and multiplications, which would be infeasible even for small values of N and T (for $N = 10$ and $T = 20$, the total number of operations has an order 10^{22}). A more efficient way is the *forward-backward(FB)* algorithm which solves the problems by use of $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$ operations. In this paper we present a numerical stable variant of *FB*. For another variants see [10], [2], [8]

The forward-backward algorithm recursively computes desired quantities using the *HMM* forward and backward probabilities:

$$\hat{\alpha}_t(s_t) = p(s_t | o_{1:t}), \quad \hat{\beta}_t(s_t) = \frac{p(o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})}, \quad (5)$$

as follows.

1) *Forward initialization*: For $1 \leq j \leq N$:

$$c_0 = \sum_{j=1}^N \pi_j b_j(o_0), \quad \hat{\alpha}_0(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad (6)$$

2) *Forward recursion*: For $0 \leq t \leq T$, $1 \leq j \leq N$:

$$c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t), \quad (7)$$

$$\hat{\alpha}_t(j) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t}, \quad (8)$$

3) *Backward initialization*: For $1 \leq i \leq N$:

$$\hat{\beta}_T(i) = 1, \quad (9)$$

4) *Backward recursion*: For $T-1 \geq t \geq 0$, $1 \leq i, j \leq N$:

$$\hat{\beta}_t(i) = \frac{\sum_{j=1}^N a_{ij} b_j(o_{t+1}) \hat{\beta}_{t+1}(j)}{c_{t+1}}. \quad (10)$$

The normalization factors c_t ensure that the probabilities sums to one and represents the conditional observational probabilities:

$$c_0 = p(o_0), \quad c_t = p(o_t | o_{0:t-1}). \quad (11)$$

Once the forward and backward probabilities are computed we can compute the marginal as

$$p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) = \alpha_l(s_l) \cdot \prod_{t=l+1}^r \frac{a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \beta_r(s_r) \quad (12)$$

Two most commonly used marginals $p(s_{t-1:t} | \mathbf{o})$ and $p(s_t | \mathbf{o})$ can be computed as follows

$$p(s_{t-1:t} | \mathbf{o}) = \frac{\hat{\alpha}_{t-1}(s_{t-1}) a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t) \hat{\beta}_t(o_t)}{c_t}, \quad (13)$$

$$p(s_t | \mathbf{o}) = \hat{\alpha}_t(s_t) \cdot \hat{\beta}_t(s_t). \quad (14)$$

The majority of computations are performed in the forward and backward recursion phases, which results in the time complexity $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$. The storing of all forward and backward vectors along with the normalization factors requires $\mathcal{O}(NT)$ memory.

III. ENTROPY COMPUTATION OF HIDDEN MARKOV MODELS

The conditional entropy of *HMM* is given with

$$H(\mathbf{S} | \mathbf{o}) = - \sum_{\mathbf{s}} p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) \log p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}). \quad (15)$$

while, the subsequence constrained entropy is

$$H(S_{-l:r} | s_{l:r}, o_{0:T}) = - \sum_{\mathbf{s}_{-l:r}} p(\mathbf{s}_{-l:r} | s_{l:r}, o_{0:T}) \cdot \log p(\mathbf{s}_{-l:r} | s_{l:r}, o_{0:T}). \quad (16)$$

If we introduce

$$H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) = - \sum_{\mathbf{s}_{-l:r}} p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) \cdot \log p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}), \quad (17)$$

we can derive the following equality

$$H(S_{-l:r} | s_{l:r}, \mathbf{o}) = \frac{H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) + \log p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o})}{p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o})} \quad (18)$$

A direct evaluation of (15) is infeasible as there are N^T terms. In the following text we consider efficient algorithms for the entropy computation.

First, in the next two subsections, we review two algorithms based on the entropy decomposition rules [4]

$$H(X, Y) = H(X) + H(Y | X), \quad (19)$$

$$H(Y | X) = \sum_x p(x) \cdot H(Y | X = x). \quad (20)$$

After that, in the next section we derive the new algorithms based on the *ESRFB* algorithm.

A. The algorithm by Mann and McCallum

Mann and McCallum proposed the algorithm for the linear chain *conditional random fields* entropy gradient computation [9], which can also be used for *HMMs*. The algorithm uses the conditional probabilities

$$\hat{p}_{t|t+1}(i|j) = p(s_t | s_{t+1}, \mathbf{o}) = \frac{p(s_{t:t+1} | \mathbf{o})}{p(s_{t+1} | \mathbf{o})}, \quad (21)$$

$$\hat{p}_{t|t-1}(i|j) = p(s_t | s_{t-1}, \mathbf{o}) = \frac{p(s_{t-1:t} | \mathbf{o})}{p(s_{t-1} | \mathbf{o})}, \quad (22)$$

which, in turn, are computed using the *FB* algorithm and the forward and backward entropies, which, in turn, are computed with the recursive procedure based on the entropy

decomposition formulas (19). The forward entropy $H_t^\alpha(s_t)$ at time t is defined as the entropy of state sequence $S_{0:t-1}$ which ends in s_t , for a given observation sequence \mathbf{o} :

$$H_t^\alpha(s_t) = H(S_{0:t-1}|s_t, \mathbf{o}). \quad (23)$$

while the backward entropy $H_t^\beta(s_t)$ at time t is the entropy of state sequence $S_{t+1:T}$ which starts in s_t :

$$H_t^\beta(s_t) = H(S_{t+1:T}|s_t, \mathbf{o}). \quad (24)$$

Using the forward and backward entropies, subsequence constrained entropy conditional *HMM* entropy can be recursively computed as in the following algorithm.

1) *Forward backward algorithm*: Compute and store forward and backward probabilities using *FB* algorithm.

2) *Forward entropy initialization*: For $1 \leq j \leq N$:

$$H_0^\alpha(j) = 0; \quad (25)$$

3) *Forward entropy recursion*: for $0 \leq t \leq T-1$, $1 \leq i, j \leq N$:

$$H_{t+1}^\alpha(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N p_{t|t+1}(i|j) \left(H_t^\alpha(i) - \log p_{t|t+1}(i|j) \right), \quad (26)$$

where $\hat{p}_{t|t+1}(i|j)$ is computed using (21), (13) and (14).

4) *Backward entropy initialization*: For $1 \leq j \leq N$:

$$H_T^\beta(j) = 0; \quad (27)$$

5) *Backward entropy recursion*: for $0 \leq t \leq T-1$, $1 \leq i, j \leq N$:

$$H_{t-1}^\beta(j) = \sum_{i=1}^T p_{t|t-1}(i|j) \left(H_t^\beta(i) - \log p_{t|t-1}(i|j) \right). \quad (28)$$

where $\hat{p}_{t|t-1}(i|j)$ is computed using (22), (13) and (14).

6) *Termination*:

$$\begin{aligned} H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o}) &= \\ &= p(s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o}) \left(H_l^\alpha(s_l) + H_r^\beta(s_r) + \log p(s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o}) \right), \end{aligned} \quad (29)$$

$$H(S_{-l:r}|s_{l:r}, \mathbf{o}) = \frac{H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o}) + \log p(s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o})}{p(s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o})} \quad (30)$$

The time complexity of algorithm is $\mathcal{O}(N^2T + N^{r-l})$, where $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$ is for the forward-backward entropy computation and $\mathcal{O}(N^{r-l})$ for the termination phase. The memory complexity depends on the sequence length since all forward and backward vectors should be available in forward and backward entropy recursion phases; regarding $\mathcal{O}(N^{r-l})$ space required for storing the results in the termination phase, the total memory complexity is $\mathcal{O}(NT + N^{r-l})$.

The algorithm can also be used for the computation of entropy using the equality

$$H(\mathbf{S}|\mathbf{o}) = H(S_T|\mathbf{o}) + \sum_{s_{0:T-1}} p(s_T|\mathbf{o}) \cdot H_T^{(\alpha)}(s_T), \quad (31)$$

which follows from the entropy decomposition formulas and definition of forward entropy. In this case, the backward entropy pass is not needed, but the time and memory complexity are not reduced, since the forward and backward probabilities still need to be computed. In the following subsection we review the algorithm developed in [6] by Hernando et al., which computes the entropy with the memory complexity independent of the sequence length.

B. The algorithm by Hernando et al.

In [6], Herando et al. develop the recursive algorithm for the computation of Hidden Markov model entropy. It uses *HMM* forward probability

$$\hat{\alpha}_t(s_t) = p(s_t|o_{1:t}), \quad (32)$$

conditional probability

$$\hat{p}_{t|t-1}(s_t|s_{t-1}) = p(s_{t-1}|s_t, o_{1:t}), \quad (33)$$

and intermediate entropy

$$H_t(s_t) = H(S_{0:t-1}|s_t, o_{1:t}). \quad (34)$$

HMM entropy is computed as follows.

1) *Initialization*: For $1 \leq j \leq N$ set:

$$H_0(j) = 0, \quad (35)$$

$$\hat{\alpha}_0(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{\sum_{i=1}^N \pi_i b_i(o_1)}. \quad (36)$$

2) *Induction*: For $1 \leq t \leq T$ and $1 \leq j \leq N$ set:

$$\hat{\alpha}_t(j) = \frac{\sum_{i=1}^N \hat{\alpha}_{t-1}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{\sum_{k=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \hat{\alpha}_{t-1}(i) a_{ik} b_k(o_t)}, \quad (37)$$

$$p_{t-1|t}(i|j) = \frac{\hat{\alpha}_{t-1}(i) a_{ij}}{\sum_{k=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \hat{\alpha}_{t-1}(k) a_{kj}}, \quad (38)$$

$$H_t(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N p_{t-1|t}(i|j) \left(H_{t-1}(i) - \log p_{t-1|t}(i|j) \right). \quad (39)$$

3) *Termination*:

$$H(\mathbf{S}|\mathbf{o}) = \sum_{j=1}^N \hat{\alpha}_T(j) \left(H_T(j) - \log \hat{\alpha}_T(j) \right). \quad (40)$$

The algorithm runs with the linear time complexity $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$ and in fixed memory space independent of sequence length, $\mathcal{O}(N^2)$, since the vectors $\hat{\alpha}_{t-1}$, H_{t-1} and the matrix $p_{t-1|t}$ should be computed only once in $t-1$ -th iteration and, after having been used for the computation of H_t , they can be deleted.

IV. THE FORWARD-BACKWARD OVER THE COMMUTATIVE SEMIRING

The *FB* algorithm for *HMMs* works for more general models in which the factors in (1) are not probabilities but the functions whose range is a commutative semiring [1]. In this section we present the forward-backward over the commutative semiring and derive the *FB* for *HMMs* as a special case.

A. The forward-backward algorithm over a commutative semiring

We begin with the definition of the commutative semiring.

Definition 1: A *commutative semiring* is a set \mathbb{K} with operations \oplus and \otimes such that both \oplus and \otimes are commutative and associative and have identity elements in \mathbb{K} ($\bar{0}$ and $\bar{1}$ respectively), and \otimes is distributive over \oplus .

Let $\mathbf{s} = \{s_0, \dots, s_T\}$ be a set of variables taking values from the set $\mathcal{S} = \{1, \dots, N\}$. We define the *local kernel* functions, $u_0 : \mathcal{S} \rightarrow \mathbb{K}$, $u_t : \mathcal{S}^2 \rightarrow \mathbb{K}$ for $t = 1, \dots, T$, and the *global kernel* function $u : \mathcal{S}^{T+1} \rightarrow \mathbb{K}$, assuming that the following factorization holds

$$u(\mathbf{s}) = u_0(s_0) \otimes \bigotimes_{t=1}^T u_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) \quad (41)$$

for all $\mathbf{s} = (s_0, \dots, s_T) \in \mathcal{S}^{T+1}$.

The *FB* algorithm solves two problems

- 1) The *marginalization problem*: Compute the sum

$$v_{a:b}(s_{a:b}) = \bigoplus_{s_0:T-a:b} u(\mathbf{s}), \quad (42)$$

- 2) The *normalization problem*: Compute the sum

$$Z = \bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}). \quad (43)$$

Similarly as in *HMM*, the *FB* recursively computes the *forward variable*

$$\alpha_i(s_i) = \bigoplus_{s_0:i-1} u_0(s_0) \bigotimes_{t=1}^i u_t(s_{t-1}, s_t), \quad (44)$$

which is initialized to

$$\alpha_0(s_0) = u_0(s_0), \quad (45)$$

and recursively computed using

$$\alpha_i(s_i) = \bigoplus_{s_{i-1}} u_{i-1}(s_{i-1}, s_i) \otimes \alpha_{i-1}(s_{i-1}), \quad (46)$$

and the *backward variable*

$$\beta_i(s_i) = \bigoplus_{s_{i+1}:T} \bigotimes_{t=i+1}^T u_t(s_{t-1}, s_t), \quad (47)$$

which is recursively computed using

$$\beta_t(s_t) = \bigoplus_{s_{t+1}} u_{t+1}(s_t, s_{t+1}) \otimes \beta_{t+1}(s_{t+1}), \quad (48)$$

and initialized to

$$\beta_T(s_T) = 1. \quad (49)$$

Once, the forward α_l and backward β_r variables are computed, we can solve the marginalization problem by use of the formula

$$v_{l:r}(s_{l:r}) = \alpha_l(s_l) \otimes \bigotimes_{i=l+1}^r u_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \otimes \beta_r(s_r). \quad (50)$$

The normalization problem can be solved with the forward pass only according to

$$\bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}) = \bigoplus_{s_T} \alpha_T(s_T). \quad (51)$$

In the following subsection we derive the *FB* algorithm for *HMMs* as a special case of the *FB* over the commutative semiring.

B. HMM forward-backward as a special case of the forward-backward over the commutative semiring

The conditional *HMM* probability $p(\mathbf{s}|\mathbf{o})$ can be seen as a special case of the global kernel factorization (41) if \oplus and \otimes stand for the addition and multiplication of the real numbers. To clarify this, recall that joint *HMM* probability (1) has the form

$$p(\mathbf{s}, \mathbf{o}) = \pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0) \prod_{t=1}^T a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t), \quad (52)$$

and that according to the chain rule, conditional observational probability can be represented as

$$p(o_{0:T}) = p(o_0) \cdot \prod_{t=1}^T p(o_t|o_{0:t-1}) = c_0 \cdot \prod_{t=1}^T c_t, \quad (53)$$

where $c_0 = p(o_0)$ and $c_t = p(o_t|o_{0:t-1})$ as in (11). Then,

$$p(\mathbf{s}|\mathbf{o}) = \frac{p(\mathbf{s}, \mathbf{o})}{p(\mathbf{o})} = z_0(s_0) \prod_{t=1}^T z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t), \quad (54)$$

where

$$z_0(s_0) = \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) = \frac{a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t}. \quad (55)$$

According to the equation (2), the subsequence conditional probabilities can be represented as $p(s_{0:i}|o_{0:i}) = z_0(s_0) \prod_{t=1}^i z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t)$, and the forward variable (56) has the form

$$\alpha_i(s_i) = \sum_{s_{0:i-1}} z_0(s_0) \prod_{i=t}^i z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) = p(s_i|o_{0:i}), \quad (56)$$

in agreement with (5). The recursive equations (46), (45) for the forward variable have the form

$$\alpha_0(s_0) = z_0(s_0) = \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad (57)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_t(s_t) &= \sum_{s_{t-1}} z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) \cdot \alpha_{t-1}(s_{t-1}) = \\ &= \frac{\sum_{s_{t-1}} a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t) \alpha_{t-1}(s_{t-1})}{c_t}, \end{aligned} \quad (58)$$

and the normalization factors can be computed using the probability condition

$$\sum_{s_t} \alpha_t(s_t) = \sum_{s_t} p(s_t|o_{0:t}) = 1, \quad (59)$$

which gives

$$c_0 = \sum_{j=1}^N \pi_j b_j(o_0) \quad c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t). \quad (60)$$

and the definition of forward variable and its recursive equations agrees with the equations from section II. Similarly, according to the equation (3), $p(s_{i+1:T}, o_{i+1:T} | s_t) = \prod_{t=i+1}^T z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t)$, the backward variable is

$$\beta_i(s_i) = \sum_{s_{i+1:T}} \prod_{t=i+1}^T z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) = \frac{p(o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})}, \quad (61)$$

with the recursive equation:

$$\beta_T(s_T) = 1, \quad (62)$$

$$\beta_t(s_t) = \frac{\sum_{s_{t+1}} a_{s_t s_{t+1}} b_{s_t}(o_t) \alpha_{t-1}(s_{t-1})}{c_{t+1}}. \quad (63)$$

Finally, in the same manner, the equation (50) reduces to (64)

$$p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) = \alpha_l(s_l) \cdot \prod_{t=l+1}^r \frac{a_{s_{t-1}, s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \beta_r(s_r), \quad (64)$$

which retrieves the *HMM* forward-backward algorithm.

V. THE FORWARD-BACKWARD ALGORITHM OVER THE ENTROPY SEMIRING

In this section we consider the forward-backward algorithm over the entropy semiring (*ESRFB*) and its application to *HMM* entropy computation. The entropy semiring (*ESR*), which is introduced in [3] and [5], is defined as follows.

Definition 2: The entropy semiring is a commutative semiring for which $\mathbb{K} = \mathbb{R}^2$ and the semiring operations are defined with:

$$(z_1, h_1) \oplus (z_2, h_2) = (z_1 + z_2, h_1 + h_2), \quad (65)$$

$$(z_1, h_1) \otimes (z_2, h_2) = (z_1 z_2, z_1 h_2 + z_2 h_1), \quad (66)$$

for all $(z_1, h_1), (z_2, h_2)$ from \mathbb{R}^2 . The identities for \oplus and \otimes are $(0, 0)$ and $(1, 0)$, respectively.

The first component of an ordered pair is called a *z*-part, while the second one is an *h*-part. The following lemma can be proven by the induction (see [7]).

Lemma 1: Let $(z_i, z_i h_i) \in \mathcal{R}^2$ for all $0 \leq i \leq T$. Then, the following equality holds:

$$\bigotimes_{i=0}^T (z_i, z_i h_i) = \left(\prod_{i=0}^T z_i, \prod_{i=0}^T z_i \cdot \sum_{j=0}^T h_j \right). \quad (67)$$

Let the local kernels in (41) have the form:

$$u_0(s_0) = (z_0(s_0), z_0(s_0) h_0(s_0)); \quad (68)$$

$$u_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) = (z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i), z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) h_i(s_{i-1}, s_i)), \quad (69)$$

where

$$z_0(s_0) = \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) = \frac{a_{s_{t-1} s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t}. \quad (70)$$

with $c_0 = p(o_0)$, $c_t = p(o_t | o_{0:t-1})$ and

$$h_0(s_0) = \log z_0(s_0), \quad h_t(s_{t-1}, s_t) = \log z_t(s_{t-1}, s_t). \quad (71)$$

From Lemma 1, it follows that the *z* and *h* parts of the global kernel

$$u(\mathbf{s}) = u_0(s_0) \otimes \bigotimes_{i=1}^T u_i(s_{i-1}, s_i), \quad (72)$$

are given with:

$$u(\mathbf{s})^{(z)} = z_0(s_0) \prod_{i=1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \quad (73)$$

$$u(\mathbf{s})^{(h)} = z_0(s_0) \prod_{i=1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \cdot \quad (74)$$

$$(h_0(s_0) + \sum_{j=1}^T h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j)). \quad (75)$$

Note that

$$h_0(s_0) + \sum_{j=1}^T h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j) = \log \left(z_0 \cdot \prod_{j=1}^T z_j(s_{j-1}, s_j) \right), \quad (76)$$

and, according to the factorization (54) for *HMM* conditional probability $p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) = z_0 \cdot \prod_{i=1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i)$, we can represent the global kernel as follows

$$u(\mathbf{s}) = (p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}), p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) \log p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o})). \quad (77)$$

Hence, by summing of the global kernel we can obtain the entropies $H(\mathcal{S} | \mathbf{o})$ or $H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o})$ as the *h* part of the sum, which depends on the set of the variables which are summed out. Two types of the summation correspond to the normalization and marginalization of the global kernel which can be solved with the forward-backward algorithm over the entropy semiring.

The *z* and *h* parts of the forward and backward variables in the entropy semiring can also be derived using Lemma 1. For the forward vector,

$$\alpha_t(s_t) = \bigoplus_{s_{0:t-1}} u_0(s_0) \otimes \bigotimes_{i=1}^t u_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \quad (78)$$

we have

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{0:t-1}} z_0(s_0) \cdot \prod_{i=1}^t z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \quad (79)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(h)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{0:t-1}} z_0(s_0) \cdot \prod_{i=1}^t z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \cdot \quad (80)$$

$$(h_0(s_0) + \sum_{j=1}^t h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j)), \quad (81)$$

and by use of the equality $p(s_{0:t} | o_{0:t}) = z_0(s_0) \prod_{i=1}^t z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i)$, we obtain

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{0:t}} p(s_{0:t} | o_{0:t}) = p(s_t | o_{0:t}), \quad (82)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(h)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{0:t}} p(s_{0:t} | o_{0:t}) \log p(s_{0:t} | o_{0:t}). \quad (83)$$

The *z*-part of the *ESR* forward vector is the *HMM* forward probability as defined in the sections II and IV-B, while the information about subsequence entropies is propagated through the *h*-part, so that at each step we have

$$H(S_{0:t} | o_{0:t}) = \sum_{s_t} \alpha_t^{(h)}(s_t). \quad (84)$$

The forward vector is initialized to $u_0(s_0)$ and regarding (68) we have:

$$\alpha_0^{(z)}(s_0) = z_0(s_0) = \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad (85)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_0^{(h)}(y_0) &= z_0(s_0) h_0(s_0) = \\ &= \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0} \log \frac{\pi_{s_0} b_{s_0}(o_0)}{c_0}. \end{aligned} \quad (86)$$

The z and h forward recursive equation

$$\alpha_i(s_i) = \bigoplus_{s_{i-1}} u_{i-1}(s_{i-1}, s_i) \otimes \alpha_{i-1}(s_{i-1}), \quad (87)$$

can be determined using the definition of the entropy semiring as

$$\alpha_i^{(z)}(s_i) = \sum_{s_{i-1}} z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \alpha_{i-1}^{(z)}(s_{i-1}) \quad (88)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_i^{(h)}(s_i) &= \sum_{s_{i-1}} z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \cdot \\ &(\alpha_{i-1}^{(h)}(s_{i-1}) + h_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \alpha_{i-1}^{(z)}(s_{i-1})), \end{aligned} \quad (89)$$

or equivalently

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \quad (90)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \alpha_t^{(h)}(j) &= \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \\ &(\alpha_{t-1}^{(h)}(i) + \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \log \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t}). \end{aligned} \quad (91)$$

Similarly as in sections II and IV-B, factors c_t can be found by normalization of z -parts:

$$c_0 = \sum_{j=1}^N \pi_j b_j(o_0) \quad c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t). \quad (92)$$

The backward vector

$$\beta_i(s_i) = \bigoplus_{s_{i+1:T}} \bigotimes_{t=i+1}^T u_t(s_{t-1}, s_t), \quad (93)$$

has corresponding z and h parts

$$\beta_t^{(z)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{t+1:T}} \prod_{i=t+1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \quad (94)$$

$$\beta_t^{(h)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{t+1:T}} \prod_{i=t+1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \cdot \sum_{j=t+1}^T h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j). \quad (95)$$

The equality (3) implies

$$\prod_{i=t+1}^T z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) = \frac{p(s_{t+1:T}, o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})} \quad (96)$$

and we have

$$\beta_t^{(z)}(s_t) = \frac{p(o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})} \quad (97)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \beta_t^{(h)}(s_t) &= \\ &\sum_{s_{t+1:T}} \frac{p(s_{t+1:T}, o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})} \log \frac{p(s_{t+1:T}, o_{t+1:T} | s_t)}{p(o_{t+1:T} | o_{0:t})}, \end{aligned} \quad (98)$$

which gives the z -part of the *ESR* backward vector, the same as *HMM* backward probability from the sections II and IV-B.

The backward vector is initialized according to $\beta_T(s_T) = 1$:

$$\beta_T(s_T)^{(z)} = 1, \quad \beta_T(s_T)^{(h)} = 0. \quad (99)$$

while the recursive equation

$$\beta_t(s_t) = \bigoplus_{s_{t+1}} u_{t+1}(s_t, s_{t+1}) \otimes \beta_{t+1}(s_{t+1}), \quad (100)$$

reduces to

$$\beta_i^{(z)}(s_i) = \sum_{s_{i+1}} z(s_i, s_{i+1}) \beta_{i+1}^{(z)}(s_{i+1}) \quad (101)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \beta_i^{(h)}(s_i) &= \sum_{s_{i+1}} z(s_i, s_{i+1}) \cdot \\ &(\beta_{i+1}^{(h)}(s_{i+1}) + h(s_i, s_{i+1}) \alpha_{i+1}^{(z)}(s_{i+1})), \end{aligned} \quad (102)$$

or equivalently

$$\beta_t^{(z)}(i) = \sum_j \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}} \beta_{t+1}^{(z)}(j) \quad (103)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \beta_t^{(h)}(i) &= \sum_j \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}} \cdot \\ &(\beta_{t+1}^{(h)}(j) + \beta_{t+1}^{(z)}(j) \log \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}}), \end{aligned} \quad (104)$$

where the normalization constants c_t are computed in the forward pass.

A. *HMM* entropy computation using *ESRFB*

If the summation of the global kernel (77) is performed over the whole sequence

$$\bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}) = \bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} (p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}), p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) \log p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o})). \quad (105)$$

the z and h parts of the sum reduce to

$$\left(\bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}) \right)^{(z)} = \sum_{\mathbf{s}} p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) = 1, \quad (106)$$

$$\left(\bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}) \right)^{(h)} = \sum_{\mathbf{s}} p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) \log p(\mathbf{s} | \mathbf{o}) = -H(\mathbf{S} | \mathbf{o}) \quad (107)$$

The h part of the sum corresponds to the *HMM* entropy and it can be found as a solution of the normalization problem

$$\left(\bigoplus_{\mathbf{s}} u(\mathbf{s}) \right)^{(h)} = \sum_{s_T} \alpha_T^{(h)}(s_T) \quad (108)$$

using only the forward pass, according to equations (85)-(86), (90)-(92), as follows.

1) *Initialization*: For $j = 1, \dots, N$ set:

$$c_0 = \sum_{j=1}^N \pi_j b_j(o_0) \quad \alpha_0^{(z)}(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad (109)$$

$$\alpha_0^{(h)}(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0} \log \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0}. \quad (110)$$

2) *Induction*: For $1 \leq t \leq T$, $1 \leq j \leq N$ compute

$$c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t) \quad (111)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \quad (112)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(h)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot (\alpha_{t-1}^{(h)}(i) + \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \log \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t}). \quad (113)$$

3) *Termination*: Terminate algorithm with summations:

$$H(\mathbf{S}|\mathbf{o}) = - \sum_{j=1}^N \alpha_T^{(h)}(j), \quad (114)$$

The *ESRFB* algorithm runs in $\mathcal{O}(N^2T)$ time using $\mathcal{O}(N)$ space as in Hernando et al.'s algorithm. Moreover, both algorithms recursively compute the forward probability

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(s_t) = p(s_t|o_{0:t}). \quad (115)$$

The difference in two algorithms is in the second quantity which is computed - in Hernando et al.'s algorithm it is the intermediate entropy

$$H_t(s_t) = H(S_{0:t-1}|s_t, o_{1:t}) = - \sum_{s_{0:t-1}} p(s_{0:t-1}|s_t, o_{1:t}) \log p(s_{0:t-1}|s_t, o_{1:t}), \quad (116)$$

while in the *ESRFB* it is the h -part of the forward vector:

$$\alpha_t^{(h)}(s_t) = \sum_{s_{0:t-1}} p(s_{0:t-1}|o_{0:t}) \log p(s_{0:t-1}|o_{0:t}) \quad (117)$$

The relation between the quantities

$$\alpha_t^{(h)} = \alpha_t^{(z)} H_t(s_t) + \alpha_t^{(z)} \log \alpha_t^{(z)} \quad (118)$$

can easily be derived by use of the elementary probability transformations.

Furthermore, from *HMM* joint probability factorization (1) we can derive the Markov properties

$$p(o_t|s_t, s_{t-1}, o_{0:t-1}) = p(o_t|s_t) \quad (119)$$

$$p(s_t|s_{t-1}, o_{0:t-1}) = p(s_t|s_{t-1}), \quad (120)$$

which imply the following equalities:

$$\frac{a_{s_{t-1}s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t} = \frac{p(s_t|s_{t-1})p(o_t|s_t)}{p(o_t|o_{0:t-1})} = \frac{p(o_t, s_t|s_{t-1}, o_{0:t-1})}{p(o_t|o_{0:t-1})} = \frac{p_{t-1|t}(s_{t-1}|s_t) \cdot \alpha_t^{(z)}(s_t)}{\alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(s_{t-1})}. \quad (121)$$

where $\hat{p}_{t-1|t}(s_{t-1}|s_t) = p(s_{t-1}|s_t, o_{0:t})$ as defined in the Hernando et al.'s algorithm. Then, the recursive equations for $H_t(s_t)$ derived by Hernando et al. can also be obtained from the *ESRFB* algorithm by substituting (121) and (118) in recursive equations for $\alpha_t^{(h)}$ in *ESRFB* algorithms, which give us the close relation between two algorithms.

B. HMM subsequence constrained entropy computation using ESRFB

If the summation of the global kernel is performed over a subsequence $s_{-l:r}$

$$\bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} u(s) = \bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} (p(s|\mathbf{o}), p(s|\mathbf{o}) \log p(s|\mathbf{o})). \quad (122)$$

the z and h parts of the sum are

$$\left(\bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} u(s) \right)^{(z)} = p(s_{l:r}), \quad (123)$$

$$\left(\bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} u(s) \right)^{(h)} = -H(S_{l:r}, s_{l:r}|\mathbf{o}). \quad (124)$$

The h part of the sum corresponds to the *HMM* subsequence constrained entropy and it can be found as a solution of the marginalization problem

$$v_{l:r}(s_{l:r}) = \alpha_l(s_l) \otimes \bigotimes_{i=l+1}^r u_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \otimes \beta_r(s_r). \quad (125)$$

The z and h parts can be found using the definition for the entropy semiring operations:

$$\left(\bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} u(s) \right)^{(z)} = \alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) \prod_{i=l+1}^r z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i), \quad (126)$$

$$\begin{aligned} \left(\bigoplus_{s_{-l:r}} u(s) \right)^{(h)} &= \prod_{i=l+1}^r z_i(s_{i-1}, s_i) \cdot \\ &(\alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(h)}(s_r) + \alpha_l^{(h)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) + \\ &\alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) \sum_{j=l+1}^r h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j)) \end{aligned} \quad (127)$$

To compute the h -part of the marginal, we need l -th forward and r -th backward vectors. The l -th forward vector can be computed by *ESR* forward algorithm using recursive equations (109)-(113). However, the recursive steps (133)-(113) for the normalization constants c_t and the z part of forward vectors should be performed for all t , because the normalization constants $c_t, r < t \leq T$ should be available in the backward pass. Once the normalization constants are computed, the backward pass can be performed according to the equations (99), (103)-(104), and, after that, we can compute the subsequence constrained entropy using the equalities (126)-(139) and (18). The algorithm follows.

1) *Forward initialization*: For $j = 1, \dots, N$ set:

$$c_0 = \sum_{j=1}^N \pi_j b_j(o_0) \quad \alpha_0^{(z)}(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0}, \quad (128)$$

$$\alpha_0^{(h)}(j) = \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0} \log \frac{\pi_j b_j(o_0)}{c_0}. \quad (129)$$

2) *Full forward recursion:* For $1 \leq t \leq l$, $1 \leq j \leq N$ compute

$$c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t) \quad (130)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \quad (131)$$

$$\alpha_i^{(h)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot (\alpha_{t-1}^{(h)}(i) + \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) \log \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t}). \quad (132)$$

3) *Forward z-part recursion:* For $l+1 \leq t \leq T$, $1 \leq j \leq N$ compute

$$c_t = \sum_{j=1}^N \sum_{i=1}^N \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i) a_{ij} b_j(o_t) \quad (133)$$

$$\alpha_t^{(z)}(j) = \sum_{i=1}^N \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_t} \cdot \alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}(i). \quad (134)$$

4) *Backward initialization:* For $j = 1, \dots, N$ set:

$$\beta_T^{(z)}(j) = 1, \quad \beta_T^{(h)}(j) = 0. \quad (135)$$

5) *Backward recursion:* For $T-1 \geq t \geq r$, $1 \leq j \leq N$ compute

$$\beta_t^{(z)}(i) = \sum_j \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}} \beta_{t+1}^{(z)}(j) \quad (136)$$

$$\beta_t^{(h)}(i) = \sum_j \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}} \cdot (\beta_{t+1}^{(h)}(j) + \beta_{t+1}^{(z)}(j) \log \frac{a_{ij} b_j(o_t)}{c_{t+1}}). \quad (137)$$

6) *Termination:* For $l \leq t \leq r$, $1 \leq s_t \leq N$, compute the subsequence constrained entropy:

$$p(s_{l:r}) = \alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) \prod_{t=l+1}^r \frac{a_{s_{t-1} s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t}, \quad (138)$$

$$\begin{aligned} -H(S_{l:r}, s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) &= \prod_{t=l+1}^r \frac{a_{s_{t-1} s_t} b_{s_t}(o_t)}{c_t} \\ &+ (\alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(h)}(s_r) + \alpha_l^{(h)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) + \\ &+ \alpha_l^{(z)}(s_l) \beta_r^{(z)}(s_r) \sum_{j=l+1}^r h_j(s_{j-1}, s_j)) \end{aligned} \quad (139)$$

$$H(S_{-l:r} | s_{l:r}, \mathbf{o}) = \frac{H(S_{-l:r}, s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o}) + \log p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o})}{p(s_{l:r} | \mathbf{o})} \quad (140)$$

The time complexity of the algorithm is $\mathcal{O}(N^2 T + N^{r-l})$, where $\mathcal{O}(N^2 T)$ is for the forward-backward recursion, and $\mathcal{O}(N^{r-l})$ for the termination phase, which is the same time complexity as in Mann-MacCallum's algorithm.

On the other hand, full forward recursion phase can be realized in $\mathcal{O}(N^2 l)$ time and in fixed size memory $\mathcal{O}(N)$, since

$\alpha_{t-1}^{(z)}$, $\alpha_{t-1}^{(h)}$ and c_{t-1} can be deleted after having been used for the computation of $\alpha_t^{(z)}$, $\alpha_t^{(h)}$ and c_t . Similarly, the forward z -part recursion and backward pass requires $\mathcal{O}(N)$ space. Only additional space depending on the sequence length $\mathcal{O}(T-l)$ should be available for normalization constants in the forward z -part recursion phase, since they should be available in the backward and termination phases. Finally, regarding $\mathcal{O}(N^{r-l})$ space required for storing the results in the termination phase, the total memory complexity is $\mathcal{O}(T-l + N^{r-l})$, which slightly increases with T then $\mathcal{O}(NT + N^{r-l})$, as required by Mann-MacCallum's algorithm.

VI. CONCLUSION

This paper proposes a new algorithm for memory efficient computation of the *HMM* entropy and subsequence constrained entropy when the observation sequence is given. The algorithm is called Entropy Semiring Forward-backward (*ESRFB*) since it is based on forward-backward recursion over the entropy semiring in the same manner as in our previous paper [7].

ESRFB has the same time complexity as a previously developed algorithm for subsequence constrained *HMM* entropy computation developed by Mann and MacCallum [9], but with lower memory requirements. It is also applicable to state sequence entropy computation running with the same time and memory complexity as the recursive algorithm proposed by Hernando et al. [6]. In addition, we have shown how the recursive equations in Hernando et al.'s algorithm can be derived from the *ESRFB* recursive equations.

REFERENCES

- [1] S.M. Aji and R.J. McEliece. The generalized distributive law. *Information Theory, IEEE Transactions on*, 46(2):325–343, mar. 2000.
- [2] Christopher M. Bishop. *Pattern Recognition and Machine Learning (Information Science and Statistics)*. Springer-Verlag New York, Inc., Secaucus, NJ, USA, 2006.
- [3] Corinna Cortes, Mehryar Mohri, Ashish Rastogi, and Michael Riley. On the computation of the relative entropy of probabilistic automata. *Int. J. Found. Comput. Sci.*, 19(1):219–242, 2008.
- [4] Thomas M. Cover and Joy A. Thomas. *Elements of Information Theory (Wiley Series in Telecommunications and Signal Processing)*. Wiley-Interscience, 2006.
- [5] Jason Eisner. Parameter estimation for probabilistic finite-state transducers. In *Proceedings of the 40th Annual Meeting on Association for Computational Linguistics*, ACL '02, pages 1–8, Morristown, NJ, USA, 2002. Association for Computational Linguistics.
- [6] D. Hernando, V. Crespi, and G. Cybenko. Efficient computation of the hidden markov model entropy for a given observation sequence. *Information Theory, IEEE Transactions on*, 51(7):2681–2685, 2005.
- [7] Velimir M. Ilic, Miomir S. Stankovic, and Branimir T. Todorovic. Entropy message passing. *IEEE Transactions on Information Theory*, 57(1):219–242, 2011.
- [8] Wael Khreich, Eric Granger, Ali Miri, and Robert Sabourin. On the memory complexity of the forward-backward algorithm. *Pattern Recognition Letters*, 31(2):91–99, 2010.
- [9] Gideon S. Mann and Andrew McCallum. Efficient computation of entropy gradient for semi-supervised conditional random fields. In *Human Language Technologies 2007: The Conference of the North American Chapter of the Association for Computational Linguistics; Companion Volume, Short Papers on XX, NAACL '07*, pages 109–112, Morristown, NJ, USA, 2007. Association for Computational Linguistics.
- [10] Lawrence R. Rabiner. A tutorial on hidden markov models and selected applications in speech recognition. In *Proceedings of the IEEE*, pages 257–286, 1989.