# **APPENDIX B**

# Results of the Multiple Language Question Answering Track (QA@CLEF)

## Prepared by:

Alessandro Vallin $^{\dagger}$  and Jesús Herrera $^{\ddagger}$ 

<sup>†</sup> ITC-Irst, Trento, Italy, *vallin@itc.it* <sup>‡</sup> Dpto. Lenguajes y Sistemas Informáticos, UNED, Madrid, Spain, *jesus.herrera@lsi.uned.es* 

#### List of Run Characteristics

The following table lists the 18 participating teams and the 49 runs submitted at the CLEF-2004 Question Answering Track.

| CDOUD   | COLINITRY   |    |    | mono | lingu | al |    |  |             | DUNG   |
|---|-------------|----|----|------|-------|----|----|--|-------------|--|
| GROUP   | COUNTRY     | DE | EG |      | _     |    | DT | bilingual  | pilot<br>ES | RUNS   |
|   |             | DE | ES | FR   | IT    | NL | РТ |  |             |  |
| Bulgarian Academy of<br>Sciences              | Bulgaria    |    |    |      |       |    |    | BG=>EN   |             | bgas041bgen  |
| U. Da Coruna                                  | Spain       |    | •  |      |       |    |    |  |             | cole041eses  |
| DAEDALUS (*)                                  | Spain       |    | •  |      |       |    |    |  |             | mira041eses  |
| DFKI  | Germany     | •  |    |      |       |    |    | DE=>EN   |             | dfki041dede  |
| U.Helsinki                                    | Finland     |    |    |      |       |    |    | EL-> EN  |             | dfki041deen  |
| U.Helsinki                                    | Finland     |    |    |      |       |    |    | FI=>EN   |             | hels041fien<br>edin041deen   |
| U.Edinburgh                                   | UK          |    |    |      |       |    |    | DE=>EN<br>FR=>EN   |             | edin041deen<br>edin041fren<br>edin042fren  |
| ILC-CNR                                       | Italy       |    |    |      | ٠     |    |    |  |             | ILCP-QA-ITIT   |
| Inst. Nac. Astrofisica,<br>Optica y Electron. | Mexico      |    | •  |      |       |    |    |  |             | inao041eses<br>inao042eses   |
| ITC-irst,<br>TCC Division                     | Italy       |    |    |      | •     |    |    | IT=>EN   |             | irst041itit<br>irst042itit<br>irst041iten<br>irst042iten   |
| Linguateca, Sintef                            | Norway      |    |    |      |       |    | •  |  |             | sfnx041ptpt<br>sfnx042ptpt   |
| LIMSI-CNRS                                    | France      |    |    |      |       |    |    | FR=>EN   |             | lire041fren<br>lire042fren   |
| U.Politecnica Catalunya                       | Spain       |    | •  |      |       |    |    |  |             | talp041eses<br>talp042eses   |
| U. Alicante                                   | Spain       |    | •  |      |       |    |    |  | •           | aliv041eses<br>aliv042eses<br>alivpilot  |
| U. Amsterdam                                  | Netherlands |    |    |      |       | •  |    | EN=>NL   |             | uams041nlnl<br>uams042nlnl<br>uams041ennl  |
| U.Evora                                       | Portugal    |    |    |      |       |    | •  |  |             | PTUE041ptpt  |
| U.Hagen                                       | Germany     | •  |    |      |       |    |    |  |             | FUHA041dede  |
| U.Limerick                                    | Ireland     |    |    |      |       |    |    | FR=>EN   |             | dltg041fren<br>dltg042fren   |
| U.Neuchatel                                   | Switzerland |    |    | •    |       |    |    | BG=>FR<br>DE=>FR<br>EN=>FR<br>ES=>FR<br>IT=>FR<br>NL=>FR<br>PT=>FR |             | gine041frfr<br>gine042frfr<br>gine041bgfr<br>gine042bgfr<br>gine041defr<br>gine042defr<br>gine042enfr<br>gine041esfr<br>gine042esfr<br>gine042itfr<br>gine042itfr<br>gine042nlfr<br>gine042nlfr<br>gine042ptfr |

(\*) The DAEDALUS group submitted the results after the scheduled deadline.

#### **Results for Main Tasks**

In the following six pages the results for the main QA tasks are given. They are divided according to target languages, so that there is a separate table per language. Several tasks can be grouped in the same target language.

Each table provides the following information:

- the name of the submitted run;
- the **task** in which the group participated;
- the **number of answers** contained in each submission (divided into **Right**, **Wrong**, **ineXact** and **Unsupported**). In all the tasks there were 200 questions and systems were allowed to return just one response per question. Nevertheless, some runs count less than 200 answers, because some questions that contained mistakes were discarded;
- the overall accuracy of each run (i.e. the percentage of Right answers);
- the accuracy over the Factoid questions;
- the accuracy over the Definition questions (test sets contained around 20 of them);
- the systems' **Precision** and **Recall** in recognising the questions that did not have any answer (the correct answer-string was "**NIL**");
- the **Confidence-weighted Score**, which takes into account the systems' ability to rank the answers according to confidence. This additional measure ranges between 0 (no correct response at all) and 1 (all the answers are correct and the system is always confident about them). Since the confidence value was not mandatory, the Confidence-weighted Score was not computed for all the runs.

| German (DE | ) as target l | language: |
|------------|---------------|-----------|
|------------|---------------|-----------|

| Run Name    | Task   | #<br>Answers | #<br>Right | #<br>Wrong | #<br>ineXact | #<br>Unsupported | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ac    | ccuracy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|-------------|--------|--------------|------------|------------|--------------|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------|---------|------------------------|
|             |        |              | C          | C          |              |                  | %                   | %                  | %                  | Precision | Recall  | Score                  |
| dfki041dede | DE=>DE | 197          | 50         | 143        | 1            | 3                | 25.3                | 28.25              | 0                  | 0.13      | 0.85    | /                      |
| FUHA041dede | DE=>DE | 197          | 67         | 128        | 2            | 0                | 34                  | 31.64              | 55                 | 0.13      | 1       | 0.333                  |

## English (EN) as target language:

| Run Name    | Task   | Task #<br>Answers |       | #<br>Wrong | #<br>ineXact | #<br>Unsupported | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ace   | curacy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|-------------|--------|-------------------|-------|------------|--------------|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------|--------|------------------------|
|             |        |                   | Right |            |              |                  | %                   | %                  | %                  | Precision | Recall | Score                  |
| bgas041bgen | BG=>EN | 200               | 26    | 168        | 5            | 1                | 13                  | 11.6               | 25                 | 0.13      | 0.4    | 0.056                  |
| dfki041deen | DE=>EN | 200               | 47    | 151        | 0            | 2                | 23.5                | 23.8               | 20                 | 0.1       | 0.75   | 0.177                  |
| dltg041fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 38    | 155        | 7            | 0                | 19                  | 17.7               | 30                 | 0.17      | 0.55   | /                      |
| dltg042fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 29    | 164        | 7            | 0                | 14.5                | 12.7               | 30                 | 0.14      | 0.45   | /                      |
| edin041deen | DE=>EN | 200               | 28    | 166        | 5            | 1                | 14                  | 13.3               | 20                 | 0.14      | 0.35   | 0.049                  |
| edin041fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 33    | 161        | 6            | 0                | 16.5                | 17.7               | 5                  | 0.15      | 0.55   | 0.056                  |
| edin042deen | DE=>EN | 200               | 34    | 159        | 7            | 0                | 17                  | 16.1               | 25                 | 0.14      | 0.35   | 0.052                  |
| edin042fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 40    | 153        | 7            | 0                | 20                  | 20.5               | 15                 | 0.15      | 0.55   | 0.058                  |
| hels041fien | FI=>EN | 193               | 21    | 171        | 1            | 0                | 10.8                | 11.5               | 5                  | 0.1       | 0.85   | 0.046                  |
| irst041iten | IT=>EN | 200               | 45    | 146        | 6            | 3                | 22.5                | 22.2               | 25                 | 0.24      | 0.3    | 0.121                  |
| irst042iten | IT=>EN | 200               | 35    | 158        | 5            | 2                | 17.5                | 16.6               | 25                 | 0.24      | 0.3    | 0.075                  |
| lire041fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 22    | 172        | 6            | 0                | 11                  | 10                 | 20                 | 0.05      | 0.05   | 0.032                  |
| lire042fren | FR=>EN | 200               | 39    | 155        | 6            | 0                | 19.5                | 20                 | 15                 | 0         | 0      | 0.075                  |

## Spanish (ES) as target language:

| Run Name    | Task   | Task #<br>Answers | #<br>Right | #<br>Wrong | #<br>ineXact | #<br>Unsupported | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ad    | ccuracy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|-------------|--------|-------------------|------------|------------|--------------|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------|---------|------------------------|
|             |        | 1 1115 (* 015     | Hight      | Wrong      | mertuet      | ensupported      | %                   | %                  | %                  | Precision | Recall  | Score                  |
| aliv041eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 63         | 130        | 5            | 2                | 31.5                | 30.5               | 40                 | 0.17      | 0.35    | 0.121                  |
| aliv042eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 65         | 129        | 4            | 2                | 32.5                | 31.1               | 45                 | 0.17      | 0.35    | 0.144                  |
| cole041eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 22         | 178        | 0            | 0                | 11                  | 11.6               | 5                  | 0.1       | 1       | /                      |
| inao041eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 45         | 145        | 5            | 5                | 22.5                | 19.44              | 50                 | 0.19      | 0.5     | /                      |
| inao042eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 37         | 152        | 6            | 5                | 18.5                | 17.78              | 25                 | 0.21      | 0.5     | /                      |
| mira041eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 18         | 174        | 7            | 1                | 9                   | 10                 | 0                  | 0.14      | 0.55    | /                      |
| talp041eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 48         | 150        | 1            | 1                | 24                  | 18.8               | 70                 | 0.19      | 0.5     | 0.087                  |
| talp042eses | ES=>ES | 200               | 52         | 143        | 3            | 2                | 26                  | 21.1               | 70                 | 0.2       | 0.55    | 0.102                  |

## French (FR) as target language:

| Run Name    | Task   | #<br>Answers | #<br>Right | #<br>Wrong | #<br>ineXact | #<br>Unsupported | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Acc   | curacy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|-------------|--------|--------------|------------|------------|--------------|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-----------|--------|------------------------|
|             |        | Allsweis     | Right      | wrong      | mexact       | Onsupported      | %                   | %                  | %                  | Precision | Recall | Score                  |
| gine041bgfr | BG=>FR | 200          | 13         | 182        | 5            | 0                | 6.5                 | 6.6                | 5                  | 0.1       | 0.5    | 0.051                  |
| gine041defr | DE=>FR | 200          | 27         | 162        | 11           | 0                | 13.5                | 13.8               | 10                 | 0.15      | 0.2    | 0.071                  |
| gine041enfr | EN=>FR | 200          | 16         | 171        | 13           | 0                | 8                   | 8.3                | 5                  | 0.05      | 0.1    | 0.031                  |
| gine041esfr | ES=>FR | 200          | 25         | 166        | 9            | 0                | 12.5                | 13.8               | 0                  | 0.12      | 0.15   | 0.054                  |
| gine041frfr | FR=>FR | 200          | 26         | 160        | 14           | 0                | 13                  | 13.8               | 5                  | 0         | 0      | 0.046                  |
| gine041itfr | IT=>FR | 200          | 23         | 166        | 11           | 0                | 11.5                | 12.2               | 5                  | 0.15      | 0.3    | 0.047                  |
| gine041nlfr | NL=>FR | 200          | 17         | 171        | 12           | 0                | 8.5                 | 8.8                | 5                  | 0.12      | 0.2    | 0.041                  |
| gine041ptfr | PT=>FR | 200          | 22         | 170        | 8            | 0                | 11                  | 11.1               | 10                 | 0.11      | 0.15   | 0.041                  |
| gine042bgfr | BG=>FR | 200          | 13         | 180        | 7            | 0                | 6.5                 | 6.1                | 10                 | 0.1       | 0.35   | 0.038                  |
| gine042defr | DE=>FR | 200          | 32         | 155        | 13           | 0                | 16                  | 15                 | 25                 | 0.23      | 0.2    | 0.087                  |
| gine042enfr | EN=>FR | 200          | 25         | 165        | 10           | 0                | 12.5                | 11.6               | 20                 | 0.06      | 0.1    | 0.048                  |
| gine042esfr | ES=>FR | 200          | 30         | 164        | 6            | 0                | 15                  | 15.5               | 10                 | 0.11      | 0.1    | 0.063                  |
| gine042frfr | FR=>FR | 200          | 42         | 147        | 11           | 0                | 21                  | 20.5               | 25                 | 0.09      | 0.05   | 0.095                  |
| gine042itfr | IT=>FR | 200          | 27         | 165        | 8            | 0                | 13.5                | 14.4               | 5                  | 0.14      | 0.3    | 0.052                  |
| gine042nlfr | NL=>FR | 200          | 26         | 158        | 16           | 0                | 13                  | 12.2               | 20                 | 0.14      | 0.2    | 0.06                   |
| gine042ptfr | PT=>FR | 200          | 25         | 166        | 9            | 0                | 12.5                | 11.6               | 20                 | 0.1       | 0.15   | 0.05                   |

| Run Name Task | Task      | Task # |       | #<br>Answers | #           | # | #    | #    | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ac | ccuracy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|---------------|-----------|--------|-------|--------------|-------------|---|------|------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------|---------|------------------------|
|               | Answers F | Right  | Wrong | ineXact      | Unsupported | % | %    | %    | Precision           | Recall             | Score              |        |         |                        |
| ILCP-QA-ITIT  | IT=>IT    | 200    | 51    | 117          | 29          | 3 | 25.5 | 22.7 | 50                  | 0.62               | 0.5                | /      |         |                        |
| irst041itit   | IT=>IT    | 200    | 56    | 131          | 11          | 2 | 28   | 26.6 | 40                  | 0.27               | 0.3                | 0.155  |         |                        |
| irst042itit   | IT=>IT    | 200    | 44    | 147          | 9           | 0 | 22   | 20   | 40                  | 0.66               | 0.2                | 0.107  |         |                        |

#### Italian (IT) as target language:

## **Dutch (NL) as target language:**

| Run Name Tas | Task         | Task # |       | #<br>Answers |             | # | #    | #    | #         | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ac | ccuracy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|--------------|--------------|--------|-------|--------------|-------------|---|------|------|-----------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------|---------|------------------------|
|              | Answers Righ | Right  | Wrong | ineXact      | Unsupported | % | %    | %    | Precision | Recall              | Score              |                    |        |         |                        |
| uams041ennl  | EN=>NL       | 200    | 70    | 122          | 7           | 1 | 35   | 31   | 65.2      | 0                   | 0                  | 0.222              |        |         |                        |
| uams041nlnl  | NL=>NL       | 200    | 88    | 98           | 10          | 4 | 44   | 42.3 | 56.5      | 0                   | 0                  | 0.284              |        |         |                        |
| uams042nlnl  | NL=>NL       | 200    | 91    | 97           | 10          | 2 | 45.5 | 45.2 | 47.8      | 0.55                | 0.25               | 0.326              |        |         |                        |

## Portuguese (PT) as target language:

| Run Name Tas | Task   | Task #  |       |       |         | #<br>Wrong  | #<br>ineXect | #<br>Unsupported | Overall<br>Accuracy | Accuracy<br>over F | Accuracy<br>over D | NIL Ac | ccuracy | Confidence<br>weighted |
|--------------|--------|---------|-------|-------|---------|-------------|--------------|------------------|---------------------|--------------------|--------------------|--------|---------|------------------------|
|              |        | Answers | Right | Wrong | ineXact | Unsupported | %            | %                | %                   | Precision          | Recall             | Score  |         |                        |
| PTUE041ptpt  | PT=>PT | 199     | 56    | 125   | 18      | 0           | 28.1         | 28.5             | 25.8                | 0.14               | 0.9                | 0.243  |         |                        |
| sfnx041ptpt  | PT=>PT | 199     | 22    | 165   | 8       | 4           | 11           | 11.9             | 6.4                 | 0.13               | 0.7                | /      |         |                        |
| sfnx042ptpt  | PT=>PT | 199     | 30    | 154   | 10      | 5           | 16           | 11.3             | 9.6                 | 0.16               | 0.6                | /      |         |                        |

#### **Spanish Pilot Task**

An additional pilot task was set up only for Spanish. Differently from the main tasks, list questions and questions that required more sophisticated temporal reasoning were proposed.

The following table describes the results of the run *alivpilot*, submitted by the University of Alicante, that was the only participating team. Results have been grouped by type of question (definition, factoid, list, temporally restricted by date, temporally restricted by event and temporally restricted by period).

In addition, a couple of the posed questions had no answer in the corpus (NIL) but the system did not recognise them.

The table provides the following information:

- the number of questions;

- the **number of known distinct answers**, i.e., the number of different and correct answers retrieved by the University of Alicante system in its exercise and by humans during the pre-assessment process;

- the number of given answers;

- the number of questions with at least 1 correct answer, i.e., questions with at least 1 answer assessed as Right;

- the number of given correct answers;

- the system's **recall** in recognising correct answers, i.e., the ratio between the number of given correct answers and the number of known distinct answers;

- the system's **precision** in recognising correct answers, i.e., the ratio between the number of given correct answers and the number of given answers;

- the *K*-measure<sup>1</sup> value; this metrics ranges in [-1, 1] and rewards systems that:

- answer as many questions as possible,
- give as many different right answers for each question as possible,
- give the smaller number of wrong answers to each question,
- assign higher values of the score to right answers,
- assign lower values of the score to wrong answers,
- give answer to the questions having less known answers;

- the **correlation coefficient** (**r**) between the confidence score and human assessment; human assessment equals 1 when an answer is assessed as **Right** and 0 otherwise; **r** gives an idea about the quality of the system's self-scoring.

|       |        | # questions | # known<br>distinct<br>answers | # given<br>answers | # questions<br>with at least 1<br>correct<br>answer | # given<br>correct<br>answers | recall | precision | K      | r      |
|-------|--------|-------------|--------------------------------|--------------------|---|-------------------------------|--------|-----------|--------|--------|
| Defi  | nition | 2           | 3                              | 2                  | 0 (0%)  | 0                             | 0%     | 0%        | 0      | N/A †  |
| Fac   | ctoid  | 18          | 26                             | 42                 | 4 (22.2%)   | 5                             | 19.2%  | 11.9%     | -0.029 | -0.089 |
| L     | ist    | 20          | 191                            | 55                 | 4 (20%)   | 6                             | 3.1%   | 10.9%     | -0.07  | 0.284  |
|       | Date   | 20          | 20                             | 30                 | 2 (10%)   | 2                             | 10%    | 6.6%      | -0.019 | N/A    |
| Temp. | Event  | 20          | 20                             | 42                 | 2 (10%)   | 2                             | 10%    | 4.7%      | -0.024 | 0.255  |
|       | Period | 20          | 20                             | 29                 | 3 (15%)   | 3                             | 15%    | 10.3%     | -0.003 | 0.648  |
| To    | otal   | 100         | 280                            | 200                | 15 (15%)  | 18                            | 6.4%   | 9%        | -0.086 | 0.246  |

 $\dagger$  **r** is Not Available because 0 was given for every component of any variable.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup>*K*-measure is defined in: J. Herrera, A. Peñas, and F. Verdejo. Question Answering Pilot Task at CLEF 2004. In *Proceedings of the CLEF 2004 Workshop*, Bath, United Kingdom, September 2004.