

Aaron Johnson and Florian Kerschbaum

# Editors' Introduction

DOI 10.2478/popets-2021-0001

It is our great pleasure to introduce Issue 1 of Volume 2021 of the Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (PoPETs). PoPETs is a journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). To contribute to the free availability of scientific publications, PoPETs is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

PoPETS/PETS uses a hybrid conference-journal model, one that has since been adopted by many other conferences in the field. In this model, articles are published throughout the year at regular intervals, and the papers for the year are then presented at an annual conference. Reviewers can request revisions of submitted articles, which may then be revised and resubmitted in the same year. PoPETs publishes four issues per year. By enabling resubmission across these issues, PoPETS provides a high-quality peer-review process that enables authors and reviewers to work together to produce and recognize significant scholarly contributions.

The PoPETS double-blind peer-review process is similar to other top-tier computer security publications. The process includes initial review by the Editors-in-Chief for rules compliance and in-scope content, written reviews by multiple independent reviewers, author rebuttal, discussion among reviewers, and consensus decisions with disagreements resolved by the Editors-in-Chief. The output of the review process is a set of reviews, a meta-review summarizing the reviewers' opinions after discussion, and one of the following decisions: Accept, Accept with Minor Revisions, Major Revisions, Reject and Resubmit, and Reject.

Reviewing by the Editorial Board is performed in two rounds. In the first round, the Editors-in-Chief assign two reviewers to all papers, and at the end of the round early decisions are made to reject papers that have two reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit). The remaining papers receive additional reviews in the

second round for a total of four reviews (in a few cases, submissions received fewer or more reviews).

Many articles had an external review drawn from a pool of junior experts nominated by the community<sup>1</sup>. Further external experts were invited to review certain articles. All reviews were sent to the authors of papers that proceeded to the second round of review, and those authors were invited to provide a written rebuttal to the reviews. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, other members of the Editorial Board, and the Editors-in-Chief to reach a consensus decision for each paper. One of the reviewers was then selected to write a meta-review that summarized the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by the 96 members of the Editorial Board and 39 external reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the Editorial Board that did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the membership of the Editorial Board was published before submissions were opened, and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict. In addition, Editorial Board members were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the Editors-in-Chief also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial Board members were welcome to submit articles, while the Editors-in-Chief were precluded from doing so.

There were 72 submissions to this issue of PoPETs. 11 of the 72 submissions had been invited during a previous issue to resubmit after major revision, and these were reassigned to the Editorial Board members that had reviewed the previous version. Additionally, 7 articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were resubmitted to the journal, and they were reassigned to some of the same reviewers. For all these resubmissions, the authors provided a summary of changes made to the prior version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

Of the 72 submissions, 5 papers were accepted, and 7 were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the meta-review

---

**Aaron Johnson:** U.S. Naval Research Laboratory, E-mail: aaron.m.johnson@nrl.navy.mil

**Florian Kerschbaum:** University of Waterloo, E-mail: florian.kerschbaum@uwaterloo.ca

---

<sup>1</sup> Nomination form: <https://bit.ly/2gxVDd8>

were addressed. 12 articles were ultimately accepted and form the articles published in this issue. These articles will be presented at PETS 2021.

The authors of 46 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. For 15 of them, specific major revisions were requested, to be reviewed by the same reviewers when submitted to one of the following two PoPETs submission deadlines. The remaining 31 articles received a decision of Reject and Resubmit (6 of them during the first round of review), as reviewers identified needed revisions that were unlikely to be successfully addressed in a short time. 10 papers received a decision of Reject (8 of them during the first round), either due to serious deficiencies or to being on topics out of scope for PoPETs. Finally, 4 submissions were rejected by the Editors-in-Chief without review by the Editorial Board for being out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous.

For the 2021 volume, we continue an artifact-review procedure to collect, evaluate, and distribute any artifacts related to accepted papers (e.g. source code, datasets, machine-generated proofs, formal specifications, and build environments)<sup>2</sup>. Authors of accepted papers are encouraged (but not obliged) to submit their artifacts for review by an artifact-review committee. The committee performs some checks on artifact quality (e.g. documentation, licensing, and compilation); once approved, artifacts accompany the corresponding papers on the PETS website.

We thank the following people for making the first issue of PoPETs Volume 2021 possible:

#### General Chair for PETS 2021:

- Matthew Wright, Rochester Institute of Technology

#### Program Committee / Editorial Board:

- Ruba Abu-Salma, University College London (UCL) / INRIA
- Gergely Acs, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Mário Alvim, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais
- Sebastian Angel, University of Pennsylvania
- Frederik Armknecht, Universität Mannheim
- Erman Ayday, Case Western Reserve University / Bilkent University
- Sonia Ben Mokhtar, CNRS

- Zinaida Benenson, University of Erlangen-Nuremberg
- Igor Bilogrevic, Google
- Matt Blaze, Georgetown University
- Bogdan Carbunar, Florida International University
- Melissa Chase, Microsoft Research
- Giovanni Cherubin, EPFL
- Sherman S. M. Chow, Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong
- Omar Chowdhury, University of Iowa
- Chris Clifton, Purdue University
- Lucas Davi, Universität Duisburg Essen
- Martin Degeling, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Damien Desfontaines, ETH Zurich / Google
- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Josep Domingo-Ferrer, Universitat Rovira i Virgili
- Tariq Elahi, University of Edinburgh
- David Evans, University of Virginia
- Kassem Fawaz, University of Wisconsin - Madison
- Hannes Federrath, University of Hamburg
- Julien Freudiger, Apple
- Alisa Frik, International Computer Science Institute, UC Berkeley
- Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Chaya Ganesh, Indian Institute of Science
- Simson Garfinkel, U.S. Census Bureau
- Gennie Gebhart, Electronic Frontier Foundation
- Neil Gong, Duke University
- Sergey Gorbunov, University of Waterloo
- Adam Groce, Reed College
- Thomas Gross, Newcastle University
- Florian Hahn, University of Twente
- Jamie Hayes, UCL
- Xi He, University of Waterloo
- Ryan Henry, University of Calgary
- Jaap-Henk Hoepman, Radboud University, University of Groningen
- Mathias Humbert, armasuisse W+T
- Rob Jansen, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Dali Kaafar, Macquarie University- CSIRO Data61
- Ghassan Karame, NEC Laboratories
- Markulf Kohlweiss, Edimburgh University
- Peeter Laud, Cybernetica
- Wouter Lueks, EPFL
- Shrirang Mare, Indiana University; University of Washington
- Athina Markopoulou, University of California, Irvine
- Abigail Marsh, Macalester College
- Fabio Massacci, University of Trento

<sup>2</sup> <https://petsymposium.org/artifacts.php>

- Travis Mayberry, U.S. Naval Academy
- Michelle Mazurek, University of Maryland
- Sebastian Meiser, University College London
- Luca Melis, Amazon
- Alan Mislove, Northeastern University
- Aziz Mohaisen, University of Central Florida
- Esfandiar Mohammadi, University of Luebeck
- Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, TU Wien
- Steven Murdoch, UCL
- Sashank Narain, University of Massachusetts Lowell
- Milad Nasr, UMass Amherst
- Kartik Nayak, Duke University
- Rishab Nithyanand, University of Iowa
- Melek Önen, EURECOM
- Rebekah Overdorf, EPFL
- Simon Oya, University of Waterloo
- Stefano Paraboschi, Università degli Studi di Bergamo
- Sai Teja Peddinti, Google Inc.
- Fabian Prasser, Charité - Universitätsmedizin Berlin / Berlin Institute of Health
- Joel Reardon, University of Calgary
- Elissa Redmiles, Microsoft Research
- Daniel Roche, U.S. Naval Academy
- Florentin Rochet, Université catholique de Louvain
- Nitesh Saxena, University of Alabama at Birmingham
- Florian Schaub, University of Michigan
- Wendy Seltzer, W3C
- Zubair Shafiq, University of Iowa
- Radu Sion, Stony Brook University
- Jessica Staddon, Google
- Theresa Stadler, EPFL
- Yixin Sun, University Of Virginia
- Daniel Takabi, Georgia State University
- Shruti Tople, Microsoft Research
- Florian Tramer, Stanford University
- Carmela Troncoso, EPFL
- Narseo Vallina, IMDEA Networks Institute
- Tao Wang, HKUST
- Tianhao Wang, Purdue University
- Christo Wilson, Northeastern University
- Minhui Xue, The University of Adelaide
- Attila Yavuz, University of South Florida
- Arkady Yerukhimovich, George Washington University
- Moti Yung, Google
- Yang Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yupeng Zhang, Texas A&M University

#### **Publications Chairs:**

- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE

#### **Artifact Chair:**

- Cecylia Bocovich, The Tor Project

#### **Video Chair:**

- Jeremy Clark, Concordia University
- Benjamin Zhao, University of New South Wales / CSIRO Data61

#### **Publicity/Web Chairs:**

- Kat Hanna, The Tor Project
- Rebekah Overdorf, EPFL

#### **Infrastructure Chairs:**

- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo

#### **Sponsorship Chairs:**

- Susan McGregor, Tow Center for Digital Journalism & Columbia Journalism School
- Steven Murdoch, University College London

#### **PET Award Chairs**

- Simone Fischer-Hübner, Karlstad University
- Panagiotis (Panos) Papadimitratos, KTH

#### **We thank the following shepherds:**

- Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Thomas Gross, Newcastle University
- Dali Kaafar, Macquarie University- CSIRO Data61
- Athina Markopoulou, University of California, Irvine
- Michelle Mazurek, University of Maryland
- Melek Önen, EURECOM
- Claudio Soriente, NEC

**We thank the following external reviewers:**

- Mete Akgün, University of Tuebingen
- Abdelrahman Aly, imec-COSIC, KU Leuven
- Pauline Anthonysamy, Google
- Muhammad Ahmad Bashir, International Computer Science Institute
- Rouzbeh Behnia, USF
- Gergely Biczok, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Aylin Caliskan, George Washington University
- Camille Cobb, CMU
- Christoph Egger, Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg
- Roya Ensafi, University of Michigan
- Álvaro Feal, IMDEA
- Jens Hiller, RWTH Aachen University
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo
- Boris Koepf, Microsoft Research
- Eleftherios Kokoris-Kogias, IST Austria and Facebook
- Alptekin Küpçü, Koç University
- Douglas Leith, Trinity College Dublin
- Elena Lucherini, Princeton University
- Lorenzo Martinico, University of Edinburgh
- Allison McDonald, University of Michigan
- Veelasha Moonsamy, Radboud University
- Panagiotis (Panos) Papadimitratos, KTH
- Raúl Pardo, IT University of Copenhagen
- Balazs Pejo, University of Luxembourg
- Anna Piotrowska, UCL
- Abbas Razaghpanah, International Computer Science Institute (ICSI)
- Ahmed Salem, CISPA
- Phillipp Schoppmann, HU Berlin
- Claudio Soriente, NEC
- Oleksii Starov, Palo Alto Networks
- Sanaz Taheri-Boshrooyeh, Koç University
- Oleksandr Tkachenko, TU Darmstadt / Google
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE
- Blase Ur, University of Chicago
- Daniel Votipka, University of Maryland
- Sameer Wagh, Princeton University
- Xiao Wang, Northwestern University
- Matthew Wright, RIT
- Thomas Zacharias, University of Edinburgh

Sincerely,

Aaron Johnson and Florian Kerschbaum

Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs Volume 2021 and Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2021