

Aaron Johnson and Florian Kerschbaum

Editors' Introduction

DOI 10.2478/popets-2021-0057

It is our great pleasure to introduce Issue 4 of Volume 2021 of the Proceedings on Privacy Enhancing Technologies (PoPETs). PoPETs is a journal that publishes articles accepted to the annual Privacy Enhancing Technologies Symposium (PETS). To contribute to the free availability of scientific publications, PoPETs is published under the open-access Creative Commons Attribution-NonCommercial-NoDerivs license.

PoPETS/PETS uses a hybrid conference-journal model, one that has since been adopted by many other conferences in the field. In this model, articles are published throughout the year at regular intervals, and the papers for the year are then presented at an annual conference. Reviewers can request revisions of submitted articles, which may then be revised and resubmitted in the same year. PoPETs publishes four issues per year. By enabling resubmission across these issues, PoPETS provides a high-quality peer-review process that enables authors and reviewers to work together to produce and recognize significant scholarly contributions.

The PoPETS double-blind peer-review process is similar to other top-tier computer security publications. The process includes initial review by the Editors-in-Chief for rules compliance and in-scope content, written reviews by multiple independent reviewers, author rebuttal, discussion among reviewers, and consensus decisions with disagreements resolved by the Editors-in-Chief. The output of the review process is a set of reviews, a meta-review summarizing the reviewers' opinions after discussion, and one of the following decisions: Accept, Accept with Minor Revisions, Major Revisions, Reject and Resubmit, and Reject.

Reviewing by the Editorial Board is performed in two rounds. In the first round, the Editors-in-Chief assign two reviewers to all papers, and at the end of the round early decisions are made to reject papers that have two reject scores (Reject or Reject and Resubmit). The remaining papers receive additional reviews in the

second round for a total of four reviews (in a few cases, submissions received fewer or more reviews).

Many articles had an external review drawn from a pool of junior experts nominated by the community¹. Further external experts were invited to review certain articles. All reviews were sent to the authors of papers that proceeded to the second round of review, and those authors were invited to provide a written rebuttal to the reviews. After the rebuttal period there was a discussion among the reviewers, other members of the Editorial Board, and the Editors-in-Chief to reach a consensus decision for each paper. One of the reviewers was then selected to write a meta-review that summarized the discussion and the justification for the decision.

Articles submitted to this issue were reviewed by 126 members of the Editorial Board and 76 external reviewers. The submitted articles, reviews, and discussion were available to all members of the Editorial Board that did not have a conflict of interest with the authors of the article. To identify conflicts of interest, the membership of the Editorial Board was published before submissions were opened, and authors were asked to indicate members with whom any of the authors had a conflict. In addition, Editorial Board members were asked to list the authors and institutions with which they have conflicts of interest. Finally, the Editors-in-Chief also checked for missed conflicts. Editorial Board members were welcome to submit articles, while the Editors-in-Chief were precluded from doing so.

There were 149 submissions to this issue of PoPETs. 21 of the 149 submissions had been invited during a previous issue to resubmit after major revision, and these were reassigned to the Editorial Board members that had reviewed the previous version. Additionally, 16 articles that had been rejected from a previous issue were resubmitted to the journal, and they were reassigned to some of the same reviewers. For all these resubmissions, the authors provided a summary of changes made to the prior version that explained how review concerns had been addressed.

Of the 149 submissions, 10 papers were accepted, and 19 were conditionally accepted subject to minor revisions. For the latter, a reviewer was assigned as a shepherd to ensure that the important points from the

Aaron Johnson: U.S. Naval Research Laboratory, E-mail: aaron.m.johnson@nrl.navy.mil

Florian Kerschbaum: University of Waterloo, E-mail: florian.kerschbaum@uwaterloo.ca

¹ Nomination form: <https://forms.gle/MFWa5yDgKZHz44F69>

meta-review were addressed. 28 articles were ultimately accepted for publication in this issue. These articles will be presented at PETS 2021.

The authors of 90 other articles were invited to resubmit to a future issue of PoPETs. For 32 of them, specific major revisions were requested, to be reviewed by the same reviewers when submitted to one of the following two PoPETs submission deadlines. The remaining 58 articles received a decision of Reject and Resubmit (16 of them during the first round of review), as reviewers identified needed revisions that were unlikely to be successfully addressed in a short time. 19 papers received a decision of Reject (16 of them during the first round), either due to serious deficiencies or to being on topics out of scope for PoPETs. Finally, 9 submissions were rejected by the Editors-in-Chief without review by the Editorial Board for being out of scope, over the page limit, or non-anonymous, and 2 submissions were withdrawn by the authors during the reviewing process.

For the 2021 volume, we continue an artifact-review procedure to collect, evaluate, and distribute any artifacts related to accepted papers (e.g. source code, datasets, machine-generated proofs, formal specifications, and build environments)². Authors of accepted papers are encouraged (but not obliged) to submit their artifacts for review by an artifact-review committee. The committee performs some checks on artifact quality (e.g. documentation, licensing, and compilation); once approved, artifacts accompany the corresponding papers on the PETS website.

We thank the following people for making this issue of PoPETs Volume 2021 possible:

General Chair for PETS 2021:

- Matthew Wright, Rochester Institute of Technology

Program Committee / Editorial Board:

- Ruba Abu-Salma, ICSI/UC Berkeley
- Yasemin Acar, Max Planck Institute for Security and Privacy
- Gergely Acs, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Mário Alvim, Universidade Federal de Minas Gerais
- Sebastian Angel, University of Pennsylvania
- Frederik Armknecht, Universität Mannheim
- Erman Ayday, Case Western Reserve University / Bilkent University

- Saikrishna Badrinarayanan, Visa Research
- Diogo Barradas, INESC-ID, Instituto Superior Técnico, Universidade de Lisboa
- Muhammad Ahmad Bashir, Google
- Sonia Ben Mokhtar, CNRS
- Zinaida Benenson, University of Erlangen-Nuremberg
- Alastair Beresford, University of Cambridge
- Pascal Berrang, University of Birmingham
- Gergely Biczok, CrysSys Lab, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Igor Bilogrevic, Google
- Bogdan Carbunar, Florida International University
- Melissa Chase, Microsoft Research
- Giovanni Cherubin, Turing Institute
- Sherman S. M. Chow, Chinese University of Hong Kong, Hong Kong
- Chris Clifton, Purdue University
- Camille Cobb, Carnegie Mellon University
- Anupam Das, North Carolina State University
- Martin Degeling, Ruhr-University Bochum
- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Markus Dürmuth, Ruhr University Bochum
- Tariq Elahi, University of Edinburgh
- David Evans, University of Virginia
- Kassem Fawaz, University of Wisconsin - Madison
- Ellis Fenske, US Naval Academy
- Julien Freudiger, Apple
- Alisa Frik, International Computer Science Institute, UC Berkeley
- Sébastien Gambs, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Chaya Ganesh, Indian Institute of Science
- Simson Garfinkel, U.S. Census Bureau
- Paolo Gasti, New York Institute of Technology
- Gennie Gebhart, Electronic Frontier Foundation
- Neil Gong, Duke University
- Sergey Gorbunov, University of Waterloo
- Adam Groce, Reed College
- Thomas Gross, Newcastle University
- Paul Grubbs, University of Michigan
- Florian Hahn, University of Twente
- Jamie Hayes, UCL
- Xi He, University of Waterloo
- Ryan Henry, University of Calgary
- Jaap-Henk Hoepman, Radboud University, University of Groningen
- Yuan Hong, Illinois Institute of Technology
- Mathias Humbert, armasuisse W+T
- Muhammad Ikram, Macquarie University
- Rob Jansen, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory

² <https://petsymposium.org/artifacts.php>

- Philipp Jovanovic, UCL
- Marc Juarez, USC
- Dali Kaafar, Macquarie University
- Ghassan Karame, NEC Laboratories
- Marcel Keller, CSIRO's Data61
- Katharina Kohls, Radboud University
- Markulf Kohlweiss, University of Edinburgh / IOHK
- Christiane Kuhn, Karlsruhe Institute of Technology
- Peeter Laud, Cybernetica
- Arnaud Legout, Inria
- Wouter Lueks, EPFL
- David Marco Sommer, ETH Zurich
- Piotr Mardziel, Truera
- Shirang Mare, Western Washington University
- Athina Markopoulou, University of California, Irvine
- Abigail Marsh, Macalester College
- Atefeh Mashatan, Ryerson University
- Travis Mayberry, U.S. Naval Academy
- Michelle Mazurek, University of Maryland
- Sebastian Meiser, Visa Research
- Luca Melis, Amazon
- Prateek Mittal, Princeton University
- David Mohaisen, University of Central Florida
- Meisam Mohammady, CSIRO Data 61-Concordia University
- Veelasha Moonsamy, Ruhr University Bochum
- Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, IMDEA Software Institute
- Sashank Narain, University of Massachusetts Lowell
- Milad Nasr, UMass Amherst
- Kartik Nayak, Duke University
- Rishab Nithyanand, University of Iowa
- Melek Önen, EURECOM
- Rebekah Overdorf, EPFL
- Simon Oya, University of Waterloo
- Omkant Pandey, Stony Brook University
- Stefano Paraboschi, Università degli Studi di Bergamo
- Sai Teja Peddinti, Google Inc.
- Balazs Pejo, Budapest University of Technology and Economics
- Fabian Prasser, Charité - Universitätsmedizin Berlin / Berlin Institute of Health
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Abbas Razaghpanah, International Computer Science Institute
- Joel Reardon, University of Calgary
- Elissa Redmiles, Max Planck Institute for Software Systems
- Alfredo Rial, University of Luxembourg
- Florentin Rochet, Université catholique de Louvain
- Andy Rupp, University of Luxembourg
- Nitesh Saxena, University of Alabama at Birmingham
- Florian Schaub, University of Michigan
- Dominique Schröder, Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg
- Wendy Seltzer, W3C
- Zubair Shafiq, University of Iowa
- Mahmood Sharif, Tel Aviv University and VMware
- Rachee Singh, Microsoft Research
- Radu Sion, Stony Brook University
- Jessica Staddon, Google
- Theresa Stadler, EPFL
- Yixin Sun, University Of Virginia
- Daniel Takabi, Georgia State University
- Shruti Tople, Microsoft Research
- Florian Tramer, Stanford University
- Carmela Troncoso, EPFL
- Narseo Vallina, IMDEA Networks Institute
- Eugene Vasserman, Kansas State University
- Daniel Votipka, Tufts University
- Sameer Wagh, University of California Berkeley
- Tao Wang, SFU
- Tianhao Wang, Purdue University
- Christo Wilson, Northeastern University
- Minhui Xue, The University of Adelaide
- Attila Yavuz, University of South Florida
- Arkady Yerukhimovich, George Washington University
- Moti Yung, Google
- Fan Zhang, Duke University
- Yang Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yupeng Zhang, Texas A&M University
- Yongjun Zhao, Nanyang Technological University

Publications Chairs:

- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE

Artifact Chair:

- Cecylia Bocovich, The Tor Project

Video Chairs:

- Jeremy Clark, Concordia University
- Benjamin Zhao, University of New South Wales / CSIRO Data61

Publicity/Web Chairs:

- Kat Hanna, The Tor Project
- Rebekah Overdorf, EPFL

Infrastructure Chairs:

- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Ian Goldberg, University of Waterloo

Sponsorship Chairs:

- Susan McGregor, Tow Center for Digital Journalism & Columbia Journalism School
- Steven Murdoch, University College London

Internet Arrangements Chairs:

- Peizhao Hu, Rochester Institute of Technology
- Sumita Mishra, Rochester Institute of Technology
- Hanif Rahbari, Rochester Institute of Technology

Stipend Chairs:

- Roger Dingledine, The Tor Project
- Damon McCoy, New York University
- Andrei Serjantov

PET Award Chairs

- Simone Fischer-Hübner, Karlstad University
- Panagiotis (Panos) Papadimitratos, KTH

We thank the following shepherds:

- Anonymous
- Wei Bai, Google LLC

- Sherman S. M. Chow, Chinese University of Hong Kong
- Cheng Guo, Clemson University
- Jamie Hayes, UCL
- Peeter Laud, Cybernetica
- Michelle Mazurek, University of Maryland
- Pedro Moreno-Sanchez, IMDEA Software Institute
- Tobias Pulls, Karlstad University
- Alfredo Rial, University of Luxembourg
- Daniel Roche, U.S. Naval Academy
- Florentin Rochet, Université catholique de Louvain
- Phillipp Schoppmann, Google
- Shawn Shan, University of Chicago
- Jessica Staddon, Google
- Christo Wilson, Northeastern University
- Fan Zhang, Duke University

We thank the following external reviewers:

- Aydin Abadi, University of Gloucestershire
- Mohammed Abuhamad, Loyola university Chicago
- Mete Akgün, University of Tübingen
- Rasoul Akhavan Mahdavi, University of Waterloo
- Ghouse Amjad, Brown University
- Ulrich Matchi Aïvodji, Université du Québec à Montréal (UQAM)
- Wei Bai, Google LLC
- Zijian Bao, Wuhan university
- Debabrota Basu, Inria
- Sruti Bhagavatula, Carnegie Mellon University
- Alberto Blanco-Justicia, Universitat Rovira i Virgili
- Matteo Campanelli, Aarhus University
- Jessica Colnago, Carnegie Mellon University
- Alex Davidson, University of Lisbon
- Mariano Di Martino, Hasselt University
- Jiahao Ding, University of Houston
- Christoph Egger, Friedrich-Alexander-Universität Erlangen-Nürnberg
- Saba Eskandarian, Stanford University
- Julien Gamba, IMDEA Networks Institute
- Lachlan J Gunn, Aalto University
- Cheng Guo, Clemson University
- Syed Mahbub Hafiz, University of California, Davis
- Yahya Hassanzadeh-Nazarabadi, DapperLabs
- Mate Horvath, Budapest University of Technology and Economics, CrySyS Lab.
- Thomas Humphries, University of Waterloo
- Bargav Jayaraman, University of Virginia
- Bailey Kacsmar, University of Waterloo
- Peter Kieseberg, St. Pölten University of Applied Sciences

- Nadim Kobeissi, Symbolic Software
- Chelsea Komlo, University of Waterloo
- Platon Kotzias, NortonLifelock Research Group
- Handan Kilinç Alper, Web3 Foundation
- Benjamin Lipp, Inria Paris
- Nils Lukas, University of Waterloo
- Akshaya Mani, University of Waterloo
- Rahat Masood, University of New South Wales (UNSW)
- Nate Mathews, Rochester Institute of Technology
- Allison McDonald, University of Michigan
- Richard McPherson, Google
- Shujaat Mirza, New York University
- Hooman Mohajeri Moghaddam, Princeton University
- Chan Nam Ngo, University of Trento
- Razieh Nokhbeh Zaeem, The University of Texas at Austin
- Andriy Panchenko, Brandenburg University of Technology
- Pille Pullonen, Cybernetica
- Apostolos Pyrgelis, EPFL
- Rahul Rachuri, Aarhus University
- Leonie Reichert, HU Berlin
- Ahmed Salem, CISPA – Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Cristiana Santos, Utrecht University
- Phillipp Schoppmann, Google
- Vikash Sehwal, Princeton University
- Shawn Shan, University of Chicago
- Erik Sy, University of Hamburg
- Om Thakkar, Google
- Benedetta Tondi, University of Siena
- Santiago Torres-Arias, Purdue University
- Florian Tschorsch, Technical University of Berlin
- Anselme Tueno, SAP SE
- Christine Utz, Ruhr University Bochum
- Ryan Wails, U.S. Naval Research Laboratory
- Lun Wang, University of California, Berkeley
- Tianhao Wang, Harvard University
- Janith Weerasinghe, New York University
- Zhikun Zhang, CISPA Helmholtz Center for Information Security
- Yixin Zou, University of Michigan

Sincerely,

Aaron Johnson and Florian Kerschbaum

Co-Editors-in-Chief of PoPETs Volume 2021 and Program Co-Chairs of PETS 2021