



# ARE WE SAFE ENOUGH?

Measuring and Assessing Aviation Security

Mark G. Stewart | John Mueller



© Elsevier 2018

Published: 12 September 2017

Elsevier: Amsterdam, Netherlands;  
Oxford, UK; Cambridge, MA

eBook ISBN: 9780128114766

paperback ISBN: 9780128114759

268 pages list price: \$99.95

To save 30% off the list price with free global shipping, apply discount code SOCSC317 at checkout.

More information and a free Google preview of portions of the book are available at <https://www.elsevier.com/books/ISBN/9780128114759>

Also available online via ScienceDirect.

See also

[www.cato.org/blog/are-we-safe-enough](http://www.cato.org/blog/are-we-safe-enough)

This book explains how standard risk analytic and cost-benefit analysis can be applied to aviation security in a systematic, straightforward, and fully transparent manner. It constructs a full model of the security system, describing the effectiveness, risk reduction, and cost of each layer, from policing and intelligence, to checkpoint passenger screening, to armed pilots on the flight deck.

It concludes that it is entirely possible to attain the same degree of safety at far lower cost by shifting expenditures from measures that provide little security at high cost to ones that provide more security at lower cost. In addition, it shows how the system can be made more efficient, providing great benefits to passengers, the airlines, and the taxpayer. It also finds that aviation security costs proportionately much more in the United States than in Australia, Canada, and elsewhere.

The authors also evaluate, and put into context, the degree to which terrorism presents a threat to aviation, and they discuss and apply the key notion, largely ignored by excessively risk-averse officials, of acceptable risk.

John Mueller and Mark G. Stewart are also the authors of *Terror, Security, and Money: Balancing the Risk, Benefits, and Costs of Homeland Security* (2011) and *Chasing Ghosts: The Policing of Terrorism* (2016).



## CONTENTS

### Preface

#### 1. Asking the Right Questions About Terrorism

- How Safe Are We?
- Are We as Safe as We Are Because of Security Measures?
- How Safe Is Aviation?
- Are We Safe Enough?

#### 2. Evaluating Aviation Security

- Aviation Security Costs in the United States
- Evaluating Aviation Security: Three Analytic Techniques

#### 3. Layers of Aviation Security:

##### Examining Their Individual Contribution to Risk Reduction

- Laying Out the Layers of Security
- Assessing and Evaluating the Layers of Security
- Other Potential Layers
- Calculation of Overall Risk Reduction
- Sensitivity Analysis
- Evaluating the Deterrence and Disruption Estimates: Erring on the Low Side
- Substitution Effects: Interactions and Interdependencies Among the Layers
- Other Terrorist Threats to Aviation
- Adaptive Behavior by Terrorists
- Some Comparisons
- Conclusions

#### 4. Reducing Costs Without Reducing Security:

##### Comparing the Value of Individual Layers

- Adding a Security Layer: Installed Physical Secondary Barriers
- Comparing the Layers: Three Approaches
- Evaluating the Comparative Effectiveness of FAMS, FFDO, and IPSB
- Assessing the Risk Reduction and the Cost-Effectiveness of Other Security Measures
- Evaluation of Enhanced Aviation Security Measures Put in Place After 2001
- Assessing the Layers: A Cost-Effectiveness Summary

#### 5. Improving Checkpoint Efficiency: Evaluating PreCheck

- The PreCheck Program
- The Risk Reduction Effects of Adding PreCheck
- PreCheck With Random Exclusion or Managed Inclusion
- The Economic Benefits of PreCheck
- Airport Checkpoint Screening Costs: Comparisons With the United States
- Conclusions and Extensions

#### 6. Policing and Protecting Airports

- Assessing the Risk, Consequences, and Likelihood of Terrorist Attacks on Airports
- Evaluating Counterterrorism Policing at Airports
- Evaluating Enhanced Security and Protective Measures at Airport Terminals
- Overreaction
- Conclusions

#### 7. Responsible Counterterrorism Policymaking

- Risk Communication
- Probability Neglect and Acceptable Risk
- Cost Neglect
- Risk Aversion
- Failure to Systematically Evaluate Counterterrorism Programs
- Excessive Concern About Politics, Job Security, Budget Preservation: Are Overreaction and Excessive Spending Required?
- Responsible Counterterrorism Policymaking

Appendix A: Aviation Security Costs in Australia and Elsewhere

Appendix B: Reliability Analysis of Overall System of Aviation Security

Appendix C: Sensitivity Analyses for FAMS, FFDOs, and BDOs

Appendix D: TSA PreCheck

Index

**Mark G. Stewart** is Professor of Civil Engineering and Director of the Centre for Infrastructure Performance and Reliability at The University of Newcastle in Australia. He is co-author of *Probabilistic Risk Assessment of Engineering Systems* (Chapman & Hall, 1997, and Japanese edition in 2003), and has published more than 400 technical papers and reports. He has 30 years of experience in probabilistic risk and vulnerability assessment of infrastructure and security systems that are subject to man-made and natural hazards. Professor Stewart has received extensive Australian Research Council support, including an Australian Professorial Fellowship, to develop probabilistic risk-modelling techniques for infrastructure subject to military and terrorist explosive blasts, and cost-benefit assessments of aviation security, policing, and counter-terrorism protective measures for critical infrastructure.

**John Mueller** is Woody Hayes Senior Research Scientist at the Mershon Center for International Security Studies and Professor of Political Science at Ohio State University, as well as a Senior Fellow at the Cato Institute. He has written over a dozen books, several of which have won prizes including *War and Ideas* (2011) *Atomic Obsession: Nuclear Alarmism from Hiroshima to Al-Qaeda* (2010), *Overblown* (2006), and *The Remnants of War* (2004). He has also edited the web book, *Terrorism Since 9/11: The American Cases* (2017). Earlier books include *Capitalism, Democracy, and Ralph's Pretty Good Grocery*, *Retreat from Doomsday*, *Astaire Dancing*, and *War, Presidents and Public Opinion*. He has published hundreds of articles in scholarly journals, general magazines and newspapers, is a member of the American Academy of Arts and Sciences, and has been a John Simon Guggenheim Fellow.

