

# Counting triangulations of balanced subdivisions of convex polygons<sup>1</sup>

Andrei Asinowski<sup>2,3</sup>

*Institute of Discrete Mathematics and Geometry  
Vienna University of Technology  
Vienna, Austria.*

Christain Krattenthaler<sup>4,5</sup>

*Faculty of Mathematics,  
University of Vienna  
Vienna, Austria.*

Toufik Mansour<sup>6</sup>

*Department of Mathematics,  
University of Haifa  
Haifa, Israel.*

---

## Abstract

We compute the number of triangulations of a convex  $k$ -gon each of whose sides is subdivided by  $r - 1$  points. We find explicit formulas and generating functions, and we determine the asymptotic behaviour of these numbers as  $k$  and/or  $r$  tend to infinity. We connect these results with the question of finding the planar set of  $n$  points in general position that has the minimum possible number of triangulations.

*Keywords:* Triangulations, generating functions, asymptotic analysis.

---

## 1 Introduction

Let  $k$  and  $r$  be two natural numbers,  $k \geq 3$ ,  $r \geq 1$ . Let  $\text{SC}(k, r)$  denote a convex  $k$ -gon in the plane each of whose sides is subdivided by  $r - 1$  points. (Thus, the whole configuration consists of  $n := kr$  points.)

A *triangulation* of a planar point set  $S$  is a dissection of its convex hull by non-crossing diagonals into triangles. We denote the number of triangulations of  $\text{SC}(k, r)$  by  $\text{tr}(k, r)$ . Triangulations of subdivided convex polygons were studied to some extent by Hurtado and Noy [4]<sup>7</sup> and by Bacher and Mouton [2]. We find enumeration formulas and precise asymptotic results for the numbers  $\text{tr}(k, r)$ . Some of our results extend those from earlier papers, and answer questions and conjectures stated there and in the OEIS [5].

## 2 Formulas

The first step is developing an inclusion-exclusion formula for  $\text{tr}(k, r)$ .<sup>8</sup>

**Theorem 2.1** *We have*

$$\text{tr}(k, r) = \sum_{m=0}^{\lfloor r/2 \rfloor k} (-1)^m a_{k,r,m} C_{kr-m-2}, \quad (1)$$

where  $C_n$  is the  $n$ th Catalan number, and

$$a_{k,r,m} := [x^m] \left( \sum_{\ell=0}^{\lfloor r/2 \rfloor} \binom{r-\ell}{\ell} x^\ell \right)^k.$$

**Proof (Sketch)** We construct a bijection between triangulations of  $\text{SC}(k, r)$  and a subset of triangulations of the convex  $(kr)$ -gon, determined by certain

<sup>1</sup> See <http://arxiv.org/abs/1604.02870> for a preprint of the full version of this paper.

<sup>2</sup> Research supported by the Austrian Science Foundation FWF, grant S50-N15, in the framework of the Special Research Program “Algorithmic and Enumerative Combinatorics”.

<sup>3</sup> Email: [andrei.asinowski@tuwien.ac.at](mailto:andrei.asinowski@tuwien.ac.at).

<sup>4</sup> Research partially supported by the Austrian Science Foundation FWF, grant S50-N15, in the framework of the Special Research Program “Algorithmic and Enumerative Combinatorics”.

<sup>5</sup> Email: [christian.krattenthaler@univie.ac.at](mailto:christian.krattenthaler@univie.ac.at).

<sup>6</sup> Email: [toufik@math.haifa.ac.il](mailto:toufik@math.haifa.ac.il).

<sup>7</sup> Notice the difference in notation: our  $k$  is their  $r$ , and our  $r$  is their  $k + 1$ .

<sup>8</sup> An equivalent formula was found in the earlier work [4] [2].

“forbidden” diagonals. The expression  $a_{k,r,m}$  is the number of triangulations of the convex  $(kr)$ -gon that use at least  $m$  forbidden diagonals. We apply the inclusion-exclusion principle and obtain formula (1).  $\square$

Next, we observe that  $\sum_{\ell=0}^{\lfloor r/2 \rfloor} \binom{r-\ell}{\ell} (-x)^\ell = x^{r/2} U_r \left( \frac{1}{2\sqrt{x}} \right)$ , where  $U_r(x)$  is the  $r$ th Chebyshev polynomial of the second kind. We use explicit expressions for these polynomials and for the generating function of Catalan numbers, and apply Cauchy’s integral formula. This yields

$$\mathrm{tr}(k, r) = \frac{1}{2\pi i} \int_{\mathcal{C}} \frac{\left( (1 + \sqrt{1-4x})^{r+1} - (1 - \sqrt{1-4x})^{r+1} \right)^k (1 - \sqrt{1-4x})}{2^{(r+1)k+1} x^{rk} (1-4x)^{k/2}} dx, \quad (2)$$

where  $\mathcal{C}$  is a small positively oriented circle around the origin.

Next we obtain the following expressions for  $\mathrm{tr}(k, r)$ .

**Proposition 2.2** *We have the following formulas:*

$$\mathrm{tr}(k, r) = \frac{1}{2\pi i} \int_{\mathcal{C}} \frac{(1-2t) dt}{t^{rk-1} (1-t)^{rk} (1-2t)^k} \left( (1-t)^{r+1} - t^{r+1} \right)^k \quad (3)$$

$$= -\frac{1}{4\pi i} \int_{\mathcal{C}} \frac{dt}{t^{rk} (1-t)^{rk} (1-2t)^{k-2}} \left( (1-t)^{r+1} - t^{r+1} \right)^k \quad (4)$$

$$= \sum_{j=0}^k \sum_{l=0}^{rk-(r+1)j-2} (-1)^j 2^l \binom{k}{j} \binom{k-2+l}{l} \binom{(r-1)k-l-3}{rk-(r+1)j-l-2}. \quad (5)$$

**Proof (Sketch)** The formula (3) is obtained from (2) by the substitution  $x = t(1-t)$ . In order to obtain (4) (the advantage of which is in the symmetry in  $t$  and  $1-t$ ), we take (3) and blow up the contour  $\mathcal{C}$  so that it is sent to infinity. Thus we have to take the residue at  $t = 1$  into account. In this way, another expression for  $\mathrm{tr}(k, r)$  is obtained. Its arithmetic mean with (3) yields (4).

The formula (5) is obtained from (3) by using Cauchy’s integral formula and interpreting it as a coefficient extraction formula.  $\square$

### 3 Generating Functions

Here we present formulas for “horizontal” and “vertical” generating functions for the numbers  $\mathrm{tr}(k, r)$ . In particular, we show that these generating functions are algebraic.

**Theorem 3.1** For fixed  $r \geq 2$ , we have

$$\sum_{k \geq 1} \text{tr}(k, r) x^k = -\frac{1}{2} \sum_{i=1}^r \frac{t_i(x)^r (1 - t_i(x))^r (1 - 2t_i(x))^2}{\left(\frac{d}{dt} P_r\right)(x; t_i(x))}, \quad (6)$$

where the  $t_i(x)$ ,  $i = 1, 2, \dots, r$ , are the “small” zeroes of the polynomial

$$P_r(x; t) = t^r (1 - t)^r - x \frac{(1 - t)^{r+1} - t^{r+1}}{1 - 2t},$$

that is, the zeroes  $t(x)$  for which  $\lim_{x \rightarrow 0} t(x) = 0$ .

**Proof (Sketch)** We sum up  $\sum_{k \geq 1} \text{tr}(k, r) x^k$ , using formula (4) for  $\text{tr}(k, r)$  and the summation formula for geometric series. Thus, we obtain

$$\sum_{k \geq 1} \text{tr}(k, r) x^k = -\frac{1}{4\pi i} \int_{\mathcal{C}} \frac{t^r (1 - t)^r (1 - 2t)^2}{P_r(x; t)} dt, \quad (7)$$

where, as before,  $\mathcal{C}$  is a small positively oriented circle around the origin. By the residue theorem, this integral equals the sum of the residues at poles of the integrand inside  $\mathcal{C}$ . The poles are the “small” zeroes of the denominator polynomial  $P_r(x; t)$ . We show that it has  $r$  “small” and  $r$  “not small” zeroes. We apply the residue theorem to (7) and use the formula for the residue of a quotient of two functions. This yields the claim.  $\square$

A similar reasoning yields a formula for “horizontal” generating functions.

## 4 Asymptotics

We prove the following asymptotic results for the numbers  $\text{tr}(k, r)$ .

**Theorem 4.1** 1. For fixed  $k \geq 3$ , we have

$$\text{tr}(k, r) = \frac{2^{(r-1)k} r^{k-3}}{\pi} \left( \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{du}{u^{k-2}} \sin^k(2u) \right) (1 + o(1)), \quad \text{as } r \rightarrow \infty. \quad (8)$$

2. We have

$$\text{tr}(k, r) = \frac{(2^r (r + 1))^k}{16\sqrt{\pi}(r(r + 5)/6)^{3/2} k^{3/2}} (1 + o(1)), \quad \text{as } k \rightarrow \infty. \quad (9)$$

**Proof (Sketch)** Starting from the integral representation (4), we deform the contour  $\mathcal{C}$  into a shape that consists of a segment that connects the points

$(1/2, -R)$  and  $(1/2, R)$  and the left half-circle whose diameter is this very segment. It is easy to show that the integral over the half-circle tends to 0 as  $R \rightarrow \infty$ , and, thus, upon the substitution  $t = \frac{1}{2} + iu$ , we obtain

$$\mathrm{tr}(k, r) = -\frac{2^{(r-2)k}}{\pi} \int_{-\infty}^{\infty} \frac{du}{(1+4u^2)^{rk}(iu)^{k-2}} \left( (1+2iu)^{r+1} - (1-2iu)^{r+1} \right)^k.$$

Then the substitutions  $u \rightarrow u/r$  and  $u \rightarrow u\sqrt{kR}$ , where  $R = r(r+5)/6$ , yield (8) and (9), respectively, after applying standard techniques.  $\square$

## 5 The case $k = 3$

For  $k = 3$ , we also deal with the non-balanced case, and obtain some compact formulas. Let  $\Delta(a, b, c)$  denote a triangle whose sides are subdivided by  $a$ ,  $b$  and  $c$  points, and let  $\mathrm{tr}(\Delta(a, b, c))$  denote the number of its triangulations.

**Theorem 5.1** *We have*

$$\mathrm{tr}(\Delta(a, b, c)) = 2^s - \sum_{\ell=0}^{a-2} \binom{s}{\ell} - \sum_{\ell=0}^{b-2} \binom{s}{\ell} - \sum_{\ell=0}^{c-2} \binom{s}{\ell}, \quad (10)$$

where  $s = a + b + c - 1$ ; and

$$\mathrm{tr}(\Delta(a, b, c)) = \sum_{i,j,m \geq 0} \binom{a}{i+j} \binom{b}{j+m} \binom{c}{m+i}. \quad (11)$$

**Proof (Sketch)** In order to prove (10), we notice that each triangulation either contains a diagonal that connects a corner of the basic triangle to an interior point of the opposite side, or it contains a triangle whose vertices are interior points of different sides of the basic triangle. Counting triangulations of the first kind is elementary; counting triangulations of the second kind boils down to determining

$$[x^a y^b z^c] \frac{xyz}{(1-x-y)(1-y-z)(1-z-x)},$$

which can be done by manipulations with binomial coefficients. Putting everything together, we obtain (10).

In order to prove (10)<sup>9</sup>, we construct a bijection between triangulations of  $\Delta(a, b, c)$  and the ways to choose  $i + j$  out of  $a$  points,  $j + m$  out of  $b$  points,

<sup>9</sup> This formula, restricted to the balanced case, was conjectured in OEIS/A087809 [5].

$m + i$  out of  $c$  points, that subdivide the corresponding sides, over all triples of non-negative integers  $(i, j, m)$ .  $\square$

## 6 Generalizations of the Double Circle and its triangulations

An *almost convex polygon*  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  is obtained from  $\text{SC}(k, r)$  by “infinitesimal” pulling in all the interior points of the strings into the interior of the convex hull of the basic  $k$ -gon along circular arcs of sufficiently big radius<sup>10</sup>. Any triangulation of the convex hull of  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  consists of a triangulation of  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  and triangulations of  $k$  sets of  $r$  points in convex position. Therefore our results imply asymptotic estimates for the numbers of triangulations of  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  and its convex hull. In particular, the exponential growth rate for the number of triangulations of  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  is 8 for any fixed  $k$  and  $r \rightarrow \infty$ ; and it is  $2(r+1)^{1/r} C_{r-1}^{1/r}$  for  $k \rightarrow \infty$ <sup>11</sup>. For  $r = 2$ , the convex hull of  $\text{ISC}(k, r)$  is called *Double Circle*. It was conjectured by Aichholzer, Hurtado and Noy [1] that the Double Circle of size  $n$  has the minimum number of triangulations over all planar sets of  $n$  points in general position. Our results support this conjecture showing that it is impossible to improve this example using balanced almost convex polygons of any kind and letting  $n$  to tend to  $\infty$  *in whatever way*.

## References

- [1] Aichholzer, O., F. Hurtado, and M. Noy, *A lower bound on the number of triangulations of planar point sets*, *Comput. Geom.* 29:2 (2004), 135–145.
- [2] Bacher, R., and F. Mouton, *Triangulations of nearly convex polygons*, Preprint. [arXiv:1012.2206](https://arxiv.org/abs/1012.2206).
- [3] Dumitrescu, A., A. Schulz, A. Sheffer, and C. D. Tóth, *Bounds on the maximum multiplicity of some common geometric graphs*, *SIAM Journal on Discrete Mathematics* 27:2 (2013), 802–826.
- [4] Hurtado, F., and M. Noy, *Counting triangulations of almost-convex polygons*, *Ars Combinatoria* 45 (1997), 169–179.
- [5] “The On-Line Encyclopedia of Integer Sequences”, <http://oeis.org/>.

<sup>10</sup> See [4] for details.

<sup>11</sup> The latter result is also stated in [3]; however, the argument given there is non-rigorous since it relies on [4, Theorem 3] which holds for *fixed*  $k$  rather than for  $k \rightarrow \infty$ .